

( 続紙 1 )

京都大学	博士 (地球環境学)	氏名	Ria Adoracion Apostol Lambino
論文題目	The Adoption and Institutionalization of an Environmental Disclosure Program in the Philippines: A Policy Analysis (フィリピンにおける環境情報ディスクロージャープログラムの受容と制度化：政策分析を通じて)		
(論文内容の要旨)			
<p>The interconnectedness of the global society means that innovative policy ideas cross national boundaries. In a number of cases, these ideas coming from abroad are brokered and facilitated by external institutions to developing countries, which are made attractive by possible solutions to their domestic problems and by the accompanying financial and technical resources. This research aims to understand why some good ideas do not work when transplanted in another context, despite good intentions.</p> <p>This study focuses on the specific case of the environmental performance ratings and disclosure program, Ecowatch, which initially showed the promise of curbing industrial pollution in the Philippines but did not seem to function as intended. An evaluation of the program's performance revealed that outcomes were limited and its operation was flawed. Furthermore, this program continues to be maintained despite the lack of clear signs of success. The research posits that the dysfunction can be traced all the way to the design and adoption of the policy as well as to the fit and coherence of policy design with the context. Ecowatch was considered as an outcome of policy transfer, and so it is in this manner that the policy transfer process was revisited and the history of the program adoption and its consequent institutionalization scrutinized in greater detail.</p> <p>There are four key findings in this case study: first, meaningful institutionalization was hindered by an incoherence of the design and strategy of Ecowatch with some aspects of the Philippine context. Second, the small reform space brought about by the lack of widespread bureaucratic and political acceptance, and limited ability undermining the legal authority for Ecowatch led to its dysfunctional and suboptimal operationalization. Third, the opportunistic and supply-driven policy transfer was characterized through focusing on a single-template solution and individual champions instead of distributed agents which restricted adaptation and contextualization. Fourth, the opportunistic transfer process gives rise to not only a one-time dysfunction but a persistent dysfunction through isomorphic mimicry and legitimization.</p> <p>These findings provide alternative ways of explaining effectiveness of transferred policies in general. It confirms the commonly recognized importance of adaptation and translation processes and offers the unexplored explanations of the factors that disturb these processes. Lessons from the case study led to a formulation of a preliminary conceptual framework for analyzing negotiated policy transfers using the policy cycle stages heuristic. This framework focuses on indicators that may lead to enhancement of policy implementation and outcomes: focus on the problem rather than the solution, attention to the reform space, the salience of ongoing translation and contextualization processes, and check for policy relevance. These hopefully contribute to the improvement of the policy transplantation practice.</p> <p>Chapter 1 offers an overview of the research and presents research questions and hypotheses. An overall analytical framework is presented, which provides analytic points for the study. The case study methodology is defined and sources of data as well as mann</p>			

ers of acquiring them are specified. Chapter 2 reviews what is known in the literature pertaining to aspects of implementation, policy transfer, and information-based regulation, which are all relevant to this study. An overview of information disclosure policies as applied to environmental management is presented. The gaps in the various research fields that this research hopes to address are also identified. The Philippine context is depicted in Chapter 3 in order to provide backgrounds for the setting of the case study. The description covers the institutional set-up, legal and regulatory framework for the environment and social contexts in which environmental management is enacted. Chapter 4 describes the Ecowatch program and the outcomes of the pilot phase during the period 1997-1998. It ends with an overview of the timeline of the institutional history of Ecowatch as a prelude to the main analysis in the succeeding chapters.

Chapter 5 provides evidences for the dysfunctional operation of the program. The outcomes of the program covering changes in compliance, environmental performance and information flows were investigated. The analysis shows limited outcomes as well as dysfunctional operation. Explanations for the dysfunction of Ecowatch pertaining to policy content, reform space, and policy transfer characteristics are put forth as laid out in Chapters 6, 7 and 8 respectively. Chapter 6 looks into the policy content and analyzes its fit and coherence with the institutional context of the Philippines. A comparative analysis with Indonesia indicates that some contextual factors that made the strategy successful in Indonesia, such as information infrastructure, capacity, and credibility with information-based strategies, were missing in the Philippines. The incoherence of the design and strategy of Ecowatch indicated that significant adaptation and translation processes were needed which hindered its meaningful institutionalization in the Philippine context.

Chapter 7 emphasizes the importance of looking into the institutional and organizational logics as the reform space needed when a transferred policy is adopted. Specifically, the factors of acceptance, authority, and ability are presented as important in ensuring that the policy is meaningfully adopted and sustained. This particular analysis serves to explain why the success demonstrated in the pilot program was not sustained. In Chapter 8, the study determines that the transfer process was opportunistic and supply-driven.

This process is also characterized as externally driven, solution-centered and focused on only one (best) model or template. These hindered adaptation and contextualization processes that led to the program's dysfunction. Chapter 9 explores the reasons why the program is being maintained and how the dysfunction is perpetuated. Policy inertia, isomorphic mimicry and organizational legitimacy, which are actually legacies of the policy transfer processes, are presented as reasons for the continuation of the program. An analysis of the various assessments undertaken for Ecowatch reveals that policy and program amendments focused on technical solutions, although the issues identified needed institutional adaptation. Some normative propositions are presented in this chapter.

Chapter 10 synthesizes the lessons from the case study and introduces a conceptual framework for analyzing negotiated policy transfers using the policy stage heuristic. Finally, Chapter 11 wraps up the analysis and summarizes the main findings and contributions of the dissertation.

(論文審査の結果の要旨)

近年、環境政策における国際的な政策伝播に関する研究が進展しているが、多くの途上国において共通の環境問題が深刻化するとともに政策経験が蓄積されつつ今日、途上国間での政策伝播の事例についてその機序を解明する実証研究がもつ意義は、学術的にも政策実務上もますます高まりつつある。

本論文は、インドネシアからフィリピンに伝播して実施された情報的手法であるエコウォッチという環境政策が、いかなる経緯を経てどのように所期の目的の達成に失敗したかを、政策サイクルを基盤として開発した新たな理論手法を活用しつつ解明したものである。その主要な学術的意義や社会的インパクトは、次の四点に要約される。

第一に、比較政策分析においては、先進国から途上国への政策伝播に関する研究は増加しつつあるが、途上国間での政策伝播の研究はいまだ乏しい。また、途上国における企業の環境パフォーマンスの格付け・公表政策については、インド・インドネシア・中国に関する事例研究は存在するものの、フィリピンの研究は皆無に近い。こうした国際的研究状況の下、本研究はフィリピンのエコウォッチについて、政策アイデアの受容から制度化にいたる過程の全容および政策パフォーマンスを、包括的な文献・資料分析とインタビュー調査を通じて詳らかにしている。

第二に、政策伝播において受容と制度化の二段階が重要である点については、広範な合意が見られるが、これらの段階の円滑な進展を妨げる諸要因の解明は立ち遅れている。本研究は、フィリピンの環境法制や市民社会・企業の環境マネジメント参加のあり方など、エコウォッチの法的・社会的背景を把握した上で、その試行段階での成功から本格実施段階での機能不全の発生にいたる過程を丹念に追跡し、さらにインドネシアとの比較研究も遂行している。これらの作業を通じて、公開情報量の不十分性、捕捉範囲の限界、所轄官庁の政策能力・政策経験の不足、環境NGOの限定的関与、単一型板的な政策移植、広範な関与者の不在、さらにはフィリピン社会の文化的・認知的特性などが政策の機能不全の発生にどのように寄与したかを明らかにしている。

第三に、外生的政策の制度化の成否を左右する諸要因を分析する理論枠組みの構築は、比較政策分析における喫緊の課題である。本研究は、政策サイクルを政策伝播過程に適用した新たな認識枠組みを基盤としつつ、外国の政策が当該国に移植される過程を着地空間と制度化空間からなる改革空間として独自に概念化した上で、さらに受容・権威・能力の三点に着目して、国内・国外のアクターの動機・行動や意思決定のあり方を解明している。

第四に、グローバル化の下での国際協力の活発化や政策伝播の拡大という今日状況においては、特定国での政策形成・実施の成否に関する研究が、他国の事例分析にも転用可能な普遍性をもった理論枠組み・分析装置を採用している場合には、当該研究の知見は、他国の政策形成・実施に対しても示唆を与えるものと期待され

る。本論文は、フィリピンに固有の諸要因を浮き彫りにする一方で、他国に転用可能な方法論的特質も兼ね備えているため、エコウォッチの機能不全の機序に関する本論文の知見は、フィリピンにとどまらず他の途上国にとっても少なからぬ意義をもつと思われる。

以上より、本論文は地球環境学の発展に少なからず貢献しており、博士（地球環境学）の学位論文として価値あるものと認める。また、平成26年4月1日、論文内容とそれに関連した事項について試問を行った結果、合格と認めた。

要旨公表可能日： \_\_\_\_\_ 年 \_\_\_\_\_ 月 \_\_\_\_\_ 日以降