Title

A Re-examination of the Recruiting System in "Military Provinces" in the Late Tang--Focusing on the Composition of Personnel in Ancillary Posts in Huainan and Zhexi

Author(s)

WATANABE, Takashi; CHOO, Jessey J. C.

Citation

東洋史研究 (2005), 64(1): 252-180

Issue Date

2005-06

URL

https://doi.org/10.14989/138155

Type

Journal Article

Textversion

publisher

Kyoto University
A RE-EXAMINATION OF THE RECRUITING SYSTEM IN
“MILITARY PROVINCES” IN THE LATE TANG—
FOCUSED ON THE COMPOSITION OF THE
ANCILLARY PERSONNEL IN
HUAINAN AND ZHEXI

WATANABE Takashi
translated by Jessey J.C. Choo

Introduction

The scholarship on Tang “military provinces” (fanzhen) in Japan could be divided into roughly three stages of development. The first stage, which could be referred to as the founding period, stretches from before World War II to the 1950s. The studies conducted in this period help us understand each and every aspect of the basic facts, if we take Hino Kaisaburō’s great pioneering achievements as representative. Central issues include the situation of military control as manifested in the positioning of garrison commanders, the three-way division of tax revenue from each prefecture and the significance of the financial reform in the Xianzong reign, the negotiation between the Tang court and the military provinces over economic policy, and the court’s policies to re-establish over time direct communication with prefectures bypassing the provincial governors and to eventually regain direct control over all prefectures in the early Song. In addition, we should not ignore the contributions that Iwasa Seiichirō and Kikuchi Hideo made on the origin of the military commander system and of the military organization under his control. These studies formed a foundation upon which the scholarship on Tang military provinces could advance into the next stage of development.

The second stage began roughly in the 1950s and lasted until the beginning of the 1970s. It took place at a time when the theory of periodization was enthusiastically debated as the study of Socio-Economy History reached its peak, under the

---

1 For the Japanese trends on the research of military provinces, please see Osawa 1973a, Itō 1983, Shinmizu 1983, and most recently Takase 2002. For the Chinese trend, see the brief discussion in Song 1989.
strong influence of Marxist historiography and amidst the impact of Japan’s surrender and the establishment of the new China. Thoroughly carried out during this period was the task of analyzing and clarifying the structure of provincial power based on the framework of the “Tang-Song Transition”, including on the kinds of effects that Tang provinces did or did not achieve in such transition. There naturally has been an accumulated body of research on the growth of the newly risen local elite — in other words, the former self of the scholar-official class of the Song dynasty — and its relationship with the provincial power. A series of studies by Kurihara Masuo on the fictive father-son relation that was formed between the military commanders and their subordinates⁴ and the highly refined theory of Hori Toshikazu based on his thorough investigation of the power structure of provincial guards⁵ are representative of the theories on the structure of provincial power. Since Naitō Konan, the Kyoto School has understood the structure of provincial power from the standpoint of the Tang-Song Transition having propelled the Chinese society from the medieval to the early modern period. In contrast, both Kurihara and Hori took the view that the Tang-Song Transition was of moving from the ancient into the medieval period. I find that while Tanigawa Michio’s studies on the three military provinces in the Northeast appear to reject the views of Kurihara and Hori, they are in reality based on an interest in questions of the same nature.⁶ On the relationship between provincial power and the local elite, the studies of Tanigawa and Matsui Shūichi have made clear the process through which the local elite advanced to the lowest ranking posts and cooperated with the provincial power.⁷ It was the process of the so-called “shadowy possession (yingzhàn)” with which the local magnates gained the privileges of tax and corvée exemptions by serving as civil administrators or military officers of the lower ranks (including those who served in name only) in the provincial government.⁸

One should take notice of the point Tonami Mamoru raised about the informal recruiting (bízhào) system of the Tang military provinces. Tonami pointed out the existence of a system in which the provincial governor could decide on how to staff his own administration. Tonami explained in detail not only the bureaucratic

---

⁴ See Kurihara 1953 and 1956.
⁵ See Hori 1951, 1960. The latter, especially, is a study that demonstrates the highest level of scholarship on military provinces in the second period.
⁸ For an excellent summary of the perspectives and results of the studies on the military provinces in the second stage of development in the scholarship, see also Kurihara 1970.
system at the time when such a recruiting system was utilized, but also the introduction of the newly risen class to offices of power. What Tonami presented was a remarkable insight that the introduction of the newly risen class to offices of power through this recruiting system served as the context in which the extremely fierce struggle between the Niu and the Li factions at the court took place, as each factions formed a pyramid shape vertical alignment through it. Tonami’s theory was extremely significant as it was the first to point out the importance of the existence of these provincial recruits. Considering that these provinces were civil as well as military administrations that supported the Tang dynasty for its last 150 years, these provincial recruits — who were at once the civil/administrative staff of the province and the nominal (acting, concurrent, or probationary) officials of the Tang court — certainly existed to connect the two. By calling our attention to these provincial recruits, Tonami encouraged us to reconsider the theories of the provincial power that had hitherto placed too much emphasis on its military aspect.

Therefore, the common understanding that has surfaced from these studies in the second stage is that between the rebellions of An Lushan and Huang Chao, most provinces including those that were fiscally important — such as Jiang-Huai and Sichuan — came under the direct control of the court and were re-integrated into the Tang bureaucratic system, with the exceptions of some recalcitrant provinces (jiangze), such as three provinces in the Northeastern region. The court appointed as governors to the loyal provinces (shuandi) high-ranking officials who came from families that had been aristocratic since the Southern-Northern Dynasties. In anticipation of being recalled to the court and becoming high-ranking officials in the central bureaucracy, they sent so-called “tributes (jinfeng)” made up of treasures they had acquired through irregular means to the emperor, worsened the exploitation of provincial resources, and precipitated peasant rebellions at the end of the Tang. In the late Tang, over half of the holders of official posts in the central bureaucracy, as well as the provincial governors, came from the families that were aristocratic since the Southern-Northern Dynasties. While they had lost the privileges they amassed through the nine-rank system and were cut off from the country estates that had served as their financial bases as they relocated to the Chang’an and Luoyang, they did still preserve their refinement in high culture,


10 For examples, see Matsui 1957, 1964 and Kurihara 1970.
their social prestige, and their own social network. Hence they adapted themselves to the civil examination system, and perpetuated their grip on the central bureaucracy.\footnote{For the speedy response the aristocracy had toward the civil examinations in the second half of the Tang, see Tonami 1968 and Watanabe 1993. This trend is described in Tonami as “the transformation of great-clan aristocracy into bureaucratic aristocracy” and as the transformation of class composition from one that based in personal “ascription” (property) to one that based in merit, in Seo 2001.} The existence of Tang court, which ensured the reproduction of central bureaucrats, enabled the aristocracy to control the central bureaucracy; therefore with the collapse of the Tang dynasty, the aristocratic control met its end. I refer to this final phase of the aristocratic control since the fourth century as the system of “bureaucratized aristocracy”. Since most of Tang military provinces were reintegrated into the system controlled by bureaucrats with aristocratic background, it is a bit one-sided for the scholarship in this period to consider the cause of the decline of the Tang dynasty as being the provincial nature against central authority. The departure of the third stage of scholarship lies in its adoption of a broader view in investigating the situation of the provinces in the late Tang.

One characteristic of the third stage of scholarship that has developed since the mid-1970s is its adoption of multiple angles in its perspective. Benefiting from the recent publication of the huge number of historical materials, particularly the epitaphs, the scholarship of this period has intended to delineate various aspects of the provincial establishments with approaches that were more demonstrative than theoretical as in the second stage. In terms of multi-angle perspective, Osawa Masaaki’s theory on the types of military provinces is a case in point.\footnote{See Osawa 1973b and 1975. For examples on similar attempts to categorize military provinces in China and the West, see Zhang 1983, Wang 1990, and Twitchett 1976.} He divided Tang military provinces into three categories: (A) those that were autonomous, such as the ones in the Northeast; (B) those that were independent and denied the central authority of the Tang court; (C) those that supported the central authority of the court, such as Jiangnan and Sichuan. The basic principle underlined that court policy towards the provinces was to draw financial support from group (C), suppress the appearance of group (B), and slowly reabsorb group (A), using their inability to deny the central authority of the Tang court in order to gradually control them.\footnote{See Osawa 1973b, p. 14.} In this sense, not all provinces were against the Tang court. Rather, they could be regarded as co-existing with the dynasty. Research by
Chinese scholar Zhang Guogang also proceeds along a similar line of inquiry. From the new perspective of the co-dependency between the Tang court and the provinces, some argue that the court used military provincial governments to reorganize the local administration. Others suggest that instead of achieving central control through the disintegrated litiing system, the administrative priority (of the court) had shifted to the understanding of the individual characteristics of each locality; thus at such time, the real function of military provincial governments was to serve as the vehicle for the court to control the localities. Another view — which will be presented in this article — consists of a new reading of the ancillary personnel in the provincial government (muzhi guan) and their particular role in ingeniously bridging the court and military provinces. These views are supported by the careful researches of newly discovered source materials such as the huge quantity of epitaphs, as well as fragmented historical documents related to institutions, various personal anthologies (wenji) and notes (biji). This method testifies to the second characteristic of the scholarship in this stage. Such detailed studies of source materials also led to the studies focusing on the individual characteristic of each military province.

For example, the traditional hypothesis of the power structure of the northeastern provinces was based on the role of the Headquarter Guards (yajun) of military governors. The Headquarter Guards, boasting strong solidarity, formed the primary military force that supported the autonomy of these three provinces on the one hand. On the other hand, due to their frequent coup d'etat, they also served as the cause of provincial instability. The difficulty in substantiating this hypothesis has prompted some scholars to point out the difference in terms of power structure between the Weibo and Chengde provinces. Moreover, new trends in this stage also include studies that review the relationship between the

---

14 Zhang 1983.
15 See Cheong 1992 and 1994; in which he argues that the Tang court actively utilized the military provinces as the connection points between the center and localities and pursued a policy that reorganized local administrations with the provincial governments serving as its cores.
17 For examples of the relationship between Tang literati and provincial governments, see Dai 1990, 1994, and 1998, as well as Shi 2003. With regard to provincial posts, such as the military officers, other than the ancillary personnel, see Watanabe 1988, 1991–93, and 1994a; as well as Fukai 2003.
18 See Matsui 1959, in which he paid close attention to the particularity of the Lulong Army of Youzhou in the Northeast. Recently, Moribe Yutaka has studied the Zhaoyi Army of Zelu, see Moribe 1994 and 2002c. Also see Huang 1983 on the Zhongwu Army of Chenxu.
19 See Watanabe 1995.
local elite and provincial power since the late Tang from the perspective of local society, such as on the economic flows and local defense, without slavishly following the classic definition of the local elite as the landowners, and studies that focus on the ethnicity, of such Chen Yinke’s classic study as a forerunner. Unlike scholarship in the second stage, which was enslaved within fixed perspectives, the current trends are among the most flexible in perspective and the most fruitful in collecting substantive results. Bringing together research results from all previous scholarship, the goal of the scholarship of this current stage is to establish a new and comprehensive view of the organization of military government and its position in the process of Tang-Song Transition.

This paper aims to provide a new reading on the ancillary personnel in the provincial governments and their outlook. The previous scholarship has treated the recruiting system of these ancillary personnel in the provincial governments as the ladder allowing a newly risen class to break into the bureaucracy, and hence being considered the antithesis of the aristocracy. The understanding that this recruiting system led to steadily eroding the aristocratic control over the bureaucracy and “the last such recruits became the scholar-official class of the Song Dynasty after going through a similar process repeated during the late Tang and the Five Dynasties,” was indeed attractive to us from the viewpoint of Tang-Song Transition. If this is the case, this recruiting system served as a centrifugal force that worked against the aristocracy. However, the fact remains that the aristocracy continued to dominate the bureaucracy of the dynasty after the An Lushan Rebellion as much as it did in the preceding period. As previously mentioned, much recent research has paid attention to this continuation and the political and institutional framework that made it possible. I have also repeatedly argued in recent years that the appointment to these ancillary posts in the provincial govern-

20 Satake Yasuhiko has pioneered research taking the perspective of local society; see Satake 1990. In regard to self-defense forces that focused on local protection, see the numerous works of Hino. (It is regrettable that he passed away before finishing his 1984 article.) Recent notable studies also include the two articles by Anazawa 1999 and 2002, as well as Yamanue 2002.
21 Moribe pays attention to the active role played by Sogdian military men in the military provinces in the second half of the Tang Dynasty; see Moribe 1997, 2001, 2002a, 2002b and 2004. Also Li Hongbin is interested in discussing the division of the Shoufeng Army in the period from the An Lushan Rebellion to the Xianzong reign and the establishment of new military management in the Northwest from the contexts of the internal politics of Tang and mobile relation between Tang, Tibet and Uighur, see Li 1999.
22 See Chen 1944.
ments was part of the “elite course”, linking the recruiting system of the provincial governments with the central bureaucracy. This paper builds upon earlier conclusions and furthers the understanding of the internal state of the system. In addition, it is an attempt to re-examine the true state and historical significance of this recruitment system through an investigation of the class background of those who were recruited by this system, based on the case studies of the compositions of the provincial staff at the financially advanced Huainan and Zhexi provinces.

I. The Status and Characteristics of the Ancillary Posts in the Officialdom in Mid-and Late Tang

In my previous article, I uncovered the actual condition of the ancillary posts in provincial governments. Here I will first return to it, adding some source materials I was unable to introduce. It should be noted that late Tang literati considered it normal for one to serve at an ancillary post in a provincial government. There are ample examples in which a provincial government informally recruited jinshi graduates who had entered the central bureaucracy and taken up the elite posts, such as the Collating Director (jiaoshu lang) [of the Imperial Library] that was the bottom-most of the “eight eminent posts (bajun)”, or of the slightly lesser Correcting Editor (zhengzi). Among those who served as Chief Ministers during the reigns between Emperors Daizong (r. 762-79) and Xizong (r. 873-88), as many as 73% had the experience of serving at ancillary posts in provincial governments. Many elite bureaucrats as well as those in the reserve responded enthusiastically to the recruiting calls of provincial governments. The reasons behind this were the stagnated advancement in the central bureaucracy caused by a chronic shortage of vacant posts and the roundabout career path for those who ad-

---

26 See Fengshi jianwen ji 3, p.16. Also see TYL8, “Addenda,” p. 717. The so-called “eight eminent posts” were indeed a most coveted course of advancement. One becomes a jinshi graduate, then a Collating Director, a Metropolitan District Defender (ji weiz), an Investigating Censor (jiancha yushu), a Remembrancer (shiyu), the Deputy Bureau Director (yuanwai lang), the Secretariat Drafter (zhongshu sheren), and finally the Vice Minister of the Grand Secretariat (zhongshu shilang). A slightly less coveted path was to start as passing the decree exam (zhike), becoming an Correcting Editor (zhengzi), then a Capital District Defender (jing weiz) or Vice Magistrate of Metropolitan District (ji cheng), an Attending Censor in the Palace (jianzong yushu), a Rectifier (buque), a Bureau Director (langzhong), the Supervising Secretary (jishizhong), and finally the Minister of the Grand Secretariat (zhongshu ling).
advanced based on a system of promotion by seniority (sunzi ge). Therefore, taking up an ancillary post at a provincial government became a route that bypassed these predicaments. Moreover, provincial ancillary posts offered various advantages.

The first advantage is related to the petition and transfer of the acting (jian-jiao), concurrent (jian), and probationary (shi) officials. Originally, in order to designate the status of provincial ancillary officials whose posts were extra-legal in the liuling bureaucracy, they were given court offices with added titles, such as "acting", "concurrent", or "probationary". (Those who carried the titles of the Censorate officials were called "xianguan"). What is significant is that despite the fact that these titles were mostly nominal, they could be used as official credentials to influence one's promotion as well as one's official career afterward. It became the custom that these added titles as well as those of the regular officials (zhengyuan guan) could be equally used as official credentials. Moreover, such acting, concurrent, or probationary officials could have opportunity for promotions when the provincial governor petitioned on their behalf; the obscure officer in the following epitaph is one example:

[Zheng Gao] passed the jinski examination and, ... was appointed the Correcting Editor of the Heir Apparent (taizi shenzi). The late Civil Governor of E'yu province, He Shigan, recruited [him] to be a Judge (tiuguan) [in his administration]. [His] substantive post (shishi guan) was promoted to the [probationary] Chief Musician (taichang si xielil lang). And [His] substantive post then became the [probationary] Judicial Case Reviewer (dali jingshi) and Concurrent Investigating Censor (jiancha yushz) as [he] held the provincial post of the Assistant Civil Commissioner (guancha zhishz). Moreover, he was promoted from the Attending Censor in the Palace (dianzhong shi yushi) to the Attendant Censor (shi yushz) (both as xianguan). The province was peaceful for some ten years due to the con-

28 With regard to "the system of promotion by seniority," see Toriya 1980 and Tsukigi 1987.
30 Those who served under the commissioners (including provincial governors), such as the provincial ancillary officials, while attending the morning assembly at court, were to be treated in accordance with the regular attending officials (changcan guan) and censors (of the same rank), see THY 62 “Memorial submitted by the Censorate in the tenth month of the Zhenyuan 12th year (790),” p. 1281.
tribution of Zheng's support to the provincial government.31

In other words, Zheng Gao's official credential was smoothly augmented starting with the Chief Musician, to the Judicial Case Reviewer and Concurrent Investigating Censor, then to the Attending Censor in the Palace, and finally to the Attendant Censor, all during some ten years of serving as a Judge and then as the Assistant Civil Commissioner under the Civil Governor of the E'yue province. His case — four promotions in some ten years — was the standard pace of promotion,32 it was not rare for the promotions of the acting, concurrent, or probationary officials to be expedited due to the petition of the provincial governors. I think that to be promoted faster than what was regulated had become normal.33 In addition, the Censorate posts, to which more than half of the acting, concurrent, or probationary posts that Zheng occupied belong, were the noticeable “pure posts (qing-guan)” highly esteemed as official credential.34 When one was up for an appointment to the regular post at the court (through the “Winter Recommendation (dongjian)” which will be discussed later), such an official credential as having held the acting, concurrent, or probationary post while serving in the provincial government was actually given adequate consideration. In other words, the official credential of having held an acting, concurrent, or probationary post was not nominal; it had real function in one’s career in practice. The provincial ancillary officials were frequently given the substantive posts of either the Censorate or the Court of Justice. It could be because the court assumed that the duty of these provincial ancillary officials included the surveillance of the province. Moreover, I think that the court demonstrated through these investitures its deferential treatment to the provincial ancillary officials. Noticeably, other than the acting, concurrent, or probationary posts in the Censorate or the Court of Justice, Collating

32 It seems that the transfer of those “acting”, “concurrent”, or “probationary” officials of the Censorate or the Three Departments was conducted in either “every three years” (THY 78, “Decree of the twelfth month of the Zhenyuan 16th year (800),” p. 1704); or “every three evaluations (kao)” (THY 81, “Grand Secretariat-Chancellery response to the decree of the fifth month of the Yuanhe second year (807),” pp. 1782-3), or “every thirty months” (THY 78, “Decree of the seventh month of the Yuanhe 7th year (812),” p. 1704).
34 With regard to the “pure posts”, please refer to JTS 42, “Monograph on Bureaucracy,” pp. 1804-5; and the entry on the Director of the Bureau of Personnel in Tang liudian 2.
Director (jiaoshu lang) or Correcting Editor (zhengz), Deputy Bureau Director (yuannai lang) and Bureau Director (langzhong) posts that were usually given to the provincial ancillary officials still belonged to elite posts.35

I think that the afterimage of the “guest assistant (binzuo)” of commanderies in the Southern-Northern Dynasties must have served as a context of the deferential treatment towards the provincial ancillary officials. The Military Governor of Ziqing, Tian Shengong, who came from a military background, was surprised to see that the Deputy General Commander of Henan, Li Guangbi, treated his staff with utmost courtesy. After Tian returned to his province, he inquired after Liu Wei, an Executive Officer (panguan), of what he saw. Liu answered, “Since the administrative assistants (panguan) are considered to be the ‘guests of the provincial government (mubin), there is no rite with which for the governor to receive bows [from them]”. Tian then apologized to every staff member by bowing to them.36 Pei Jie, the Executive Supervisor (lushi canjun) of Shan [superior] prefecture, was invited to the party hosted by the Civil Governor of Shangguo, Li Mian; but Pei did not appear at all. Li questioned him the next morning. Pei responded that, “there are already many respectable guest staffs (binliao) in your government. Since I am but a petty official, I dared not be in the same company.” Li apologized and, “immediately ordered a carriage to take him [to the residence of] Pei, where he paid his respects and invited Pei to serve in his province.

35 In connection to this, among the provincial ancillary officials of Huainan and Zhexi listed in Tables II and III, those whom I proved to hold “acting”, “concurrent”, or “probationary” posts are as follow: 8 Collating Directors, 1 Editorial Director (zhuzuo lang), 14 Investigating Censors, 20 Attending Censors in the Palace, 10 shiu (which means Investigating Censors or Attending Censors in the Palace), 15 Censors, 2 Vice Censors-in-Chief (yushi zhongzheng), 1 Censor-in-Chief (yushi dafei), 14 Deputy Bureau Directors, 8 Bureau Directors, 17 Judicial Case Reviewers, 3 Judicial Rectifiers (dali shi), 1 Deputy Director of Ceremony (taichang si fengli lang), 4 Chief Musicians, 1 Erudite of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices (taichang boshi), 1 Chamberlain for the Palace Revenues (taifu qing), 1 Director of the Palace Administration (dianzhong jian), 1 Instructor of the Imperial Academy (guozi zhujiao), 1 Advisor for the Heir Apparent (taizi siyi lang), 1 Executive Supervisor of the [superior] prefecture (lushi canjun), and 1 Supervisor in the Imperial Army (weizuo). Those underlined are either the “pure posts” or the “pure and prestigious posts (qingwang guan)” of the third rank and above. Other than those, the starters of the “eight eminent posts” — Collating Director and Judicial Case Reviewer (See TYL 5, “Addenda, p. 447) were also clearly elite.

36 See Fengshi wenjian ji 9, “Reformed,” p. 80. The term “panguan” was often used when referring to upper level administrative staff, such as secretary-general, of the provincial government. In such case, it is translated here as the “Executive Officer”. It was also applied more broadly to any provincial ancillary posts; as such, it is translated as the “administrative assistants.” For details, see Yan 1969, pp. 187-9.
government. It is enough to tell from these examples the high status of provincial officials.

However, I think the most important purpose of the deferential treatment of the provincial ancillary officials was to ensure a permanent returning path between the central government and provinces, tying the provincial ancillary officials to the central bureaucratic system; such linkage between the two was also closely connected to the Winter Recommendation system. The Winter Recommendation was a practice in which a finite number of incumbent officials would recommend certain qualified individuals to the regular attending officials (changcan guan) of the eighth rank and above, whom the Council of Chief Ministers [i.e. the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery (zhongshu menxia)] had the authority to appoint. The time for recommendation to take place (i.e. winter), the range of officials who have the credential to make recommendation, the maximum number of those recommended, the oral examination for the recommended, and the system of selection were all decided during Dezong's reign between the years of 788 and 793. The importance of the Winter Recommendation is that it provided a framework through which "any civil governor or prefectural administrator" could make recommendations and hence established a system whereby provincial ancillary officials under a military or civil governor could be recruited back as regular officials of the court. When the recommended were selected and appointed, the official credential of each was given serious consideration. This then was a system that gave those provincial ancillary officials who possessed the pure and important (qingyao) official credential, even if just the acting, concurrent, or probationary posts, great advantages. Cases of someone from the provincial government "being summoned to the court to take up a certain post" are numerous in the Biographies in the Official Histories. For example:

[Wang Zhi] had served in the retinues of four governorships — Caizhou,
Chenxu, Dongchuan, and Shan'nan West respectively, reached [the rank of] the Concurrent Investigating Censor by repeated recommendation [of the governor], and then was summoned to the court to take up [the post of] the Attending Censor in the Palace.

Here is another example:

[Niu Hui] served in the retinues of three provincial governors, gained [the rank of] the Attending Censor in the Palace (as xianguan), and was bestowed the crimson court robe [of the fifth rank] and honorary fish pouch (yudai). [He] was summoned to the court and appointed as the Right Rectifier.

Yet another example:

[Lu Shang], at the time when Wang Bo and Duan Wenchang were the succeeding Military Governors of Xichuan, [he] served on the retinue as the secretarial staff (jishu) and reached [the post of “acting”] Deputy Director of the Bureau of Rites. [He] was later summoned to the court and appointed as the Deputy Director of the Bureau of Works.40

Judging from these records, the number of those who entered the court and were appointed to the central bureaucracy through the Winter Recommendation is quite considerable. Note particularly that each of them held the rank of Concurrent Investigating Censor, Attending Censor in the Palace (as xianguan), or Acting Deputy Director of the Bureau of Rites as the pure and important acting, concurrent, and probationary officials while serving in provincial governments, and were then appointed to the corresponding posts of Attending Censor in the Palace, Right Rectifier, or Deputy Director of the Bureau of Works after returning to the court as pure and important regular officials.41 If we erase the characters for “acting”,

41 Originally, the Winter Recommendation applied only to those whose official credential was of the “acting or probationary” official of the fifth rank and above. However, I believe that those in the sixth rank and below carrying the titles of either Bureau (Deputy) Directors (langguan) or Censors became qualified for the Winter Recommendation following the precedence of the so-called “bashi langguan (yushu),” i.e. those who returned from fulfilling regional surveillance duty carrying
"concurrent," or "probationary" in the titles they held before their return to the court, it appears that their official credential would fit perfectly the course consisting of the "eight eminent" or that consisting of posts slightly lesser in rank. This fact would not seem so strange when one considers that provincial ancillary officials were treated as the guest staff and that those who were in charge of document, such as the Chief Secretary (zhang shuyi) or the Assistant Civil Commissioner (guancha zhishi), were noticeably reputable. For example, Li Ao’s *The Records of Extraordinary Talents* (Zhuoyi ji) records that the Lu brothers — Jian­neng, Jianci, Hongzhi, and Jianqiu — "each served as the Chief Secretary" in the provinces of Xiazhou, Hemeng, Zhaoyi, and E’zhou respectively; hence, "it appears that those in charge of documents in provincial government must be chosen among those who were renowned for literary talent at the time. There was no other case like the four Lu brothers in which each of them had such reputation and was recruited.” The talented ones in the provincial ancillary posts were recruited to fill the elite posts at the court. It is not without reason that the provincial ancillary posts were seen as the shortcut to advancement, if we consider the following. The first is a statement made in “The Edict to Appoint Wen Yaoqing and Others”:\(^{43}\):

The talented nowadays are recruited first by provincial governments and then promoted to the court. Therefore the provincial recruits are only one level below those who serve in the Three Departments or Censorate as eight or nine of every ten of them will eventually be appointed to high offices at the court.

The other is:

… Because of this, the authority of the provincial governments grew ever greater. It seemed to those who were ambitious for grandeur that the court was no longer the place where the sun shone and provincial govern-

---

\(^{42}\) The text and JTS 163 (p. 4270) record his name to be “hongzheng”, but judging from JTS 73A (p. 2830) and 177 (p. 5260), “hongzhi” should be the correct one. See also the “eighth month of the Huichang 4th year (844)—kaoyi” in ZZTJ 348, p. 8006.

\(^{43}\) *Bo jian ji* 49, p. 2924.
ments became the places of importance. [Whence] without working hard, promotions came speedily and advancement to the level of the Bureau Director or Deputy Director of State Affairs was possible.\textsuperscript{44}

Next, we should touch upon the reverse course of entering the court from provincial posts — namely, the cases of incumbent court officials being recruited to serve in provincial governments. When those high-ranking court officials — either Chief Ministers or the likely candidates of Chief Ministers — were appointed as provincial governors, they became patrons of informal recruitment. Those whom they recruited and cultivated private connections with would expect to receive various kinds of tangible or intangible benefits, beginning with the recommendations for promotion, when they were summoned back to the court as the Chief Ministers. Therefore many who already occupied elite posts such as the Metropolitan District Defender, Censor, or Bureau (Deputy) Director enthusiastically responded to recruitment of provincial governments as in the following examples. Wang Qi, the Metropolitan District Defender, was recruited by Li Jifu as the Chief Secretary of the Huainan Governorship; Lu Jian’nen, the Attending Censor in the Palace, was recruited by Niu Sengru to be the Executive Officer of Shan-nan East Governorship; Liu Gongchuo, the Deputy Director of the Bureau of Personnel, was recruited by Wu Yuanheng as an administrative assistant of Xichuan Governorship; and Li Shi, the Director of the Bureau of War, was recruited by Linghu Chu as the Deputy Governor of Taiyuan.\textsuperscript{45}

The court had repeatedly issued edicts to prohibit the informal recruitment of incumbent Bureau (Deputy) Directors or Censors, but to no avail.\textsuperscript{46} The practice of the Chief Minister-turned-Provincial Governor recruiting incumbent court officials became commonly recognized.\textsuperscript{47} Judging from the quote — “It is the practice that when the Imperial District (chixian) Defender was recruited by the Chief Minister turned Provincial Governor to his retinue, he would be given the crimson

\textsuperscript{44} TLY 8, “Addenda,” p. 693.
\textsuperscript{45} See JTS 164, p. 4278; JTS 163, p. 4272; JTS 165, p. 4300; JTS 172, p. 4483.
\textsuperscript{46} The court repeatedly issued edicts to prohibit informal recruitment of incumbent Bureau (Deputy) Directors and Censors in the year of 784 (see THY 54, “Grand Secretariat,” p. 1089) and in the years of 828 and 837 (see THY 79, “Miscellanea about the Various Commissioners,” p. 1709 and 1712). The existence of these repeated edicts tells a different story — no one really heeded the orders that banned the practice.
\textsuperscript{47} See THY 79, “Memorial submitted by the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery in the fourth month of the Kai-cheng 4th year (838),” p. 1713.
robe (fei) and the [substantive] post of the Attending Censor in the Palace—
the recruited incumbents were bestowed with ranks (acting, concurrent, or probationary) and robes based on a set pattern and regulation of designations. The provincial governor, when returning to court as a Chief Minister, customarily recommended those who served him in the province, the so-called old subordinates (guli), just as "when Lu Shang was welcomed back to the court as the Chief Minister, Sun Tang was given deferential treatment and appointed the Chief Musician, following "the custom in case of Provincial Governor turned Chief Minister (xiangmu til)." Moreover, in this other case:

Li Fangxuan graduated from the jinshi examination (AD 826) and was appointed the Collating Director of the Imperial Library, then was offered the position of Executive Officer carrying the title of Chief Musician by the Civil Governor of Jiangxi Pei Yi (served 830-833). When Pei was reassigned as the Civil Governor of Xuanhe (833), he was appointed the [probationary] Judicial Case Reviewer and the Militia Executive Officer (tuanlian panguan). As Feng Su, the Vice President of the Boards of Wars, was appointed the Military Governor of Dongchuan (835), [Li] became a Civil Executive Officer [in his retinue] carrying the title of Investigating Censor in the Reserve (jiancha yushi lixing). Less than a year later, [Li] was summoned by the Censorate and became a regular Investigating Censor. He then became the Left Rectifier. When Li Guyan, the Vice-Minister of the Chancellery as a Chief Minister, was appointed the Military Governor of Xichuan (836), Li [Fangxuan] became the Military Advisor carrying the title of Acting Deputy Director of the Bureau of Rites. He was then summoned to the court to serve as the Imperial Diarist (qiju lang). This demonstrates that it had became the norm (in the second half of the dynasty) for Tang officials, especially the upper echelon who were jinshi graduates to be first assigned as the Collating Directors, and then after having reached the more pure and important posts, to steadily advance their career following a zigzag course taking alternatively the provincial and court posts.

This demonstrates that the provincial ancillary officials were firmly tied to the

---

48 *JSCB* 117, "The Epitaph of Kong Yu (AD 874)," p. 2338.
50 *Fanchuan wenji* 8, "The Epitaph of Li Fangxuan," pp. 130-1.
central bureaucracy and were organically absorbed into the bureaucratic system of the Tang court.

Though today's provincial governors recruit talented men and treat them with respect, the latter are not always capable in the matters of military or cultural refinements. They attach themselves to the status of court post (guanzhi) and salary. When a serious incident breaks out in the province, few are capable of resolving crisis or alleviating suffering.51

Such a record in an epitaph vividly captures the image of those provincial ancillary officials who looked to the court rather than the province they served and cared about only their rank and salary. In addition, we have the following cases for consideration. The court decreed that “each military or civil governor should assign the responsibility of managing post station to one of the administrative assistants” in the Dali 14th year (779) under Emperor Daizong and again in the Yuanhe 5th year (810) under Emperor Xianzong.52 In the Taihe 4th year (830) during Emperor Wenzong’s reign, the court approved the memorial by Wei Mo, the Vice Censor-in-Chief, that “those who carry the title of Censor among the provincial ancillary officials of a Civil Governor should be entrusted to preside over the cases of appeals the local people filed.”53 At the grand gathering in the court, “in cases there are not enough Investigating Censors to oversee the assembly of official, those who serve under various governors and are visiting the court as the emissaries should temporarily take up the responsibility.”54 In these cases, the “acting”, “concurrent”, and “probationary” offices were neither nominal nor signs for promotion. The Tang court could order the title holders to serve the actual function of their title when the occasion called for it.55 In this way, we could re-

51 STMZHB, Luoyang 14, “The Epitaph of Zhang Xing (AD 850),” p. 23.
53 THY 62, “Memorial submitted by Wei Mo in the eighth month of the Taihe 4th year (830),” p. 1275. Since there were no fewer than five or six executive officers in the retinue of a civil governor, Wei Mo suggested that those who carry the acting, concurrent, probationary posts of the Censorate shall preside over judicial cases. He requested specifically that, “if they are meritorious and are able to overturn false convictions, whenever there is a vacancy among the regular posts in the Censorate, they shall be recommended for it.”
54 TGGC B, p. 53.
55 As seen in the material source listed in the footnote number 41, the provincial ancillary officials frequently received the treatment corresponded to these posts in a way similar to the Bureau (Deputy) Directors (langguan) and Censors who were sent to the provinces on surveillance duties.
gard this political measure employed by the Tang court as clever.

What was the purpose of the Tang court to connect the provincial ancillary officials to the organizations in the central bureaucracy after these elaborated procedures? It was none other than to restrain those military provinces from within, which had become strong centrifugal forces against the court as a result of the An Lushan Rebellion. If the feeling and aspirations of provincial ancillary officials could be permanently turned to the court, they would function no differently from a centripetal force that subsumed the provinces under the central control. An example of this was the action taken by various ancillary officials on the eve of the famous rebellion of Li Qi, the military governor of Zhexi.

[Governor Li] Qi often behaved in violation of laws. Lu Tan frequently remonstrated with him so sternly that those who heard them all feared for him. [Lu] had requested numerous times to be dismissed but to no avail. Though he served in the administration of [Li] Qi for seven years, he received no promotion. As Li Qi's behaviors became increasingly excessive, [Lu] Tan worried that calamity would surely befall him. Knowing that it was impossible to persuade Li, he and Pei Du, Li Yue, and Li Leng all abandoned their posts one after another. 56

In addition to the actions of Lu Tan and others, Wang Dan was killed because he “and the Army Supervisor had repeatedly persuaded” Li to return to the court in the midst of the volatile situation of the mounting rebellion. 57 Moreover when Li Shen was forced to draft an announcement for the rebellion, he “feigned to quake with fear — his brush trembled and paper shook, unable to write a single word” — and escaped the danger. 58 They are all the embodiments of this invisible centripetal force. 59 When one takes into consideration that the loyal provinces under the central control were generally incorporated into a system of control by the

---

56 Li wengong ji 12, “The Biography of the Late Military Governor of Dongchuan,” p. 62.
57 JFS 112, p. 3342.
59 The Military Governor of Zhaoyi, Lu Congshi, refused to obey orders from the court and was subsequently executed. His Chief Secretary, Kong Kan, was recorded to have also taken a similar action. According to the biography of Kong Kan that “whenever [Kan] reached treasonous language while taking down [Congshi’s] dictation, he fiercely remonstrated against it. Congshi got angry [with him]. A little over a year later, Kong returned to Luoyang claiming health reasons.” See JFS 141, pp. 4996-7.
aristocratic bureaucrats since the ninth century with the exception of the recalcitrant provinces (such as the three provinces in the Northeast), the background of military governors was no longer the only issue. Rather, we shall attempt to understand the situation by studying the structure of the upper level of the provincial power as a whole, including the ancillary officials. 60

Now before we proceed, there is still one more thing we should ascertain with regard to various provincial posts we referred to collectively as the provincial ancillary offices. There existed obvious differences in characteristics between the two parallel systems of posts among the provincial ancillary offices, those of the upper level, who were the aforementioned "guests of the provincial government (mubin)" and "guest staff (binliao)", and those of the lower level whose functions were rather closer to that of the clerks. Since the ancillary offices of provincial governments were originally part of an extra-legal system, the difference in status among them has hitherto never been clearly pointed out. The tendency thus far is to treat these two systems as one.

For example, the following posts were listed in the Monograph on Bureaucracy of XTS 49B as the provincial ancillary officials — Deputy Commissioner-acting-as-the-Military Governor (fu dashi shi jiedu shi), Camp Adjutant (xingjun sima), Deputy Governor (fush), Executive Officer (panguan), Assistant Commissioner (zhishi), Chief Secretary (zhang shuju), Judge (tuiguan), Inspector (xunguan), Associate Judge (yutu), Same as Deputy Military Governor (tong jiedu fush), Inspector of Postal Relay Stations (guanyi xunguan), Legal Staff of Provincial Courthouse (fu fashiyuan guan), Assistant Staff (yaoyi), Staff Placed According to Needs (shuyao), and Servant (qinsh). This record not only presents many problems, such as that the "Same as Military Deputy Governor" is no more than an added title and fu fashiyuan guan appears nowhere else in Tang sources, but it also had the archetypal shortcoming of listing the high level provincial officials of Inspector and above together with the low level provincial officials of Associate Judge and below. 61 The upper level provincial ancillary officials, namely the "guest

60 In fact, even in the three so-called "recalcitrant provinces" in the Northeast, there are numerous examples of jinshi degree holders and those of the aristocratic families taking up provincial ancillary posts. Having such a kind of connection through provincial ancillary officials, I believe, there was preserved between the Tang court and the three Northeastern provinces a certain interdependence, rather than just complete antagonism. For details on this point, please refer to Watanabe 1997.

61 The accounts on the military system in the Monograph on Military of XTS similarly contain many mistakes, especially in the section on extra-legal posts; see Tang 1957, pp. 32-82. Even in Yan Gengwang's studies, while he paid special care in seeking after the role of each and every
staff”, were closely linked to and constantly recruited from or into the central bureaucracy as stated earlier. There were well defined regulations with regard to their transfer (i.e. promotion) to other offices within the Censorate and the Three Departments, such as the following edict issued in the twelfth month of the Zhenyuan 16th year (800) during the reign of Dezong:

Before commissioners of Civil (guancha), General Militia (du tuanlian), Defense (fanggu), Fiscal and Agriculture (zhidu-yingtian) and Frontier-Management (jinglie) and Pacification (shaoting) of all circuits petition the Censorate and the Three Departments for promotions on behalf of their Deputy Commissioners, Camp Adjutants, Executive Officers, Assistant Commissioners, Advisors, Chief Secretaries, Judges, Inspectors, more than three years shall have passed from the previous appointment. 62

As shown in Table D, the memorial submitted by the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery in the ninth month of the Huichang 5th year (845) during the reign of Emperor Wuzong states the numbers of “the administrative assistants in all circuits.”

Those who were collectively referred to as retainers (congshi) or administrative assistants (panguan) in the historical sources were frequently the upper level provincial officials. I argue that the Tang court treated this level of provincial officials in accordance with those so-called “officials of the Censorate and Three Departments (taisheng zhi guan)”. Recruits who were well known literati in the history of literature of the mid-and late Tang, such as Han Yu (as the Civil Judge) of Bianzhou, Du Mu (as the Chief Secretary) of Huainan, and Li Shangyin (as the Inspector) of Yunzhou, each entered the upper level of the respective provincial government. The term “provincial ancillary officials”, usually refers particularly to the upper crust of provincial officials; which I have done repeatedly thus far in this article. However, we find another group of job titles under the governorship, such provincial ancillary post, he did not differentiate between the two levels and completed with only listing them one-dimensionally; see Yan 1969, pp. 177-236. Still in TD 32, “Bureaucracy,” the numbers for various kinds of staff under military governors are: 1 Deputy Military Governor, 1 Camp Adjutant, 2 Executive Officers, 1 Chief Secretary, 1 or maybe 2 Advisors (canmou) and 4 Attendant Officers (suijun) — altogether 11 or 12. It did not suffer from this kind of misunderstanding. 62

62 THY 78, “Miscellanea about the Various Commissioners,” p. 1704. See also THY 81 “Evaluation,” p. 1783. Still the reason why Camp Adjutant and Advisor do not appear in Table D is that in the year 839 such positions were eliminated as superfluous; see THY 79, p. 1713.
The Fixed Number of the Ancillary Posts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Civil Governor</th>
<th>5 (previously 6)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Military Governor</td>
<td>6 (previously 8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youzhou/Ziqing</td>
<td>7 (previously 9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huainan/Hedong</td>
<td>8†</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xichuan</td>
<td>8 (previously 12)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

†On the Huainan and Hedong, there are some missing phrase in the text, thus I attempt to estimate the number of their ancillary posts using some other materials.

As Associate Judge, Assistant Staff, Staff Placed According to Needs, and Servant, as well as, Registrar (kongmu guan), Express Courier (qushi guan), and Attendant Officer (suijun), that did not appear in the aforementioned regulation for the promotions of “acting”, “concurrent,” or “probationary” officials. With regard to the actuality of low level provincial officials of such kinds, since I have already discussed it elsewhere, please refer to that article for details. Just to restate the conclusion, there existed clerical posts of what should be called “provincial clerks (muli).”

A good example is the kongmu guan. The kongmu guan, as Hu Sanxing explains in his annotations of Zizhi tongjian, “was someone who served as clerk in administrative office. This name first appeared in Tang times. It was called such because every conceivable business (every hole and item) would have to pass through the hands of one who occupied this position.” The Biography of Liu Zhongyin, who became the Military Governor of Dongchuan, states that “a kongmu li named Bian Zhangjian had bribed the Army Supervisor with goods. Military governors that came before [Liu] could do nothing about him.” Both records sug-

---


ZTTJ 216, p. 6905.

JTS 165, p. 4306.
gest that there existed in the provincial government managers of general affairs, who were frequently referred to as the kongmu li or kongmu guan. In addition, in the episode of Han Huang and Liu Yuanzuo:

Han Huang came to the court from Jiangdong... At the time, Liu Yuanzuo was the Military Governor of Bianzhou with fearsome military strength. The court was having difficulty controlling him. In order to persuade Liu to come and pay respect to the court, Han became a fictive brother of Liu and bowed to Liu's parents. Han stayed at the Liu's for three days and paid Liu's army handsomely with gold and clothes. The army of Bianzhou came to admire Han and Liu came to respect Han. However, Liu sent someone to spy on Han. At night, Han asked his kongmu li, “How much did we spend today?” and inquired further in great detail. [Upon hearing it,] Liu despised Han.

the kongmu guan existed to examine the particulars of accounting. They clearly belong to a different category from those provincial officials of the upper level who were in charge of drafting documents and held their own against the governor as “the guests of the provincial government (mubin).” Other jobs, such as the Assistant Staff and Staff Placed According to Needs, will be mentioned in the later section. In any case, they are surely clerical posts. I believe that the class difference between the upper and lower officials in the organizations of provincial administrations nearly corresponded to the relationship between those of official status (liunei guan) and those not of official status (liuwai guan).

II. The Composition of Ancillary Officials in the Provinces of Huainan and Zhexi

Now, let us return to the system of informal recruiting by governors. The provincial ancillary posts that have been discussed thus far either in the context of “the antithesis of the system of aristocracy” and “the ladder through which the newly risen class climbed into officialdom”, or in the context of “the pyramid-

---

66 See also Cai Cili’s “The Inscription for the Dining Hall in the Office of Registrars of Qianzhou,” WYTH 806, p. 4263.
67 For example, Hu Zhen was mentioned in ZETJ 236 as the kongmu guan serving the Chengde Army (p. 7295); he was mentioned in JTS as kongmu li. See JTS 187, “The Biography of Shao Zhenchuan,” p. 4905.
68 TGSB A, p. 27.
shaped faction” in the Niu-Li Factionalism, were exclusively of the upper level that maintained a bi-directional course of advancement with the central bureaucracy. Nonetheless their close link with the central bureaucracy through their place on the bi-directional course of advancement and the elevated status they enjoyed as “guest staff (mubin),” as we saw in the previous section, warrants the question of whether the so-called “newly risen class” of the locality could easily get recruited to fill these posts to be an important issue for investigation. Since the fixed number of the upper level provincial ancillary posts could not be very high as shown in (Table D), cases such as Linghu Chu⁷⁰ and Luo Ran⁷¹ demonstrate how pro-
vincial governors had taken great pain to elevate the reputation of their administration by hiring great talents and prominent figures. Moreover, a provincial governor could earn himself the honor and his administration great reputation by employing many well-known talents. Such cases included but not limited to: the governorship of Li Xiyun at Zhexi was known for having “selected solely the men of noble character (gaoshì) at the time to serve”; the governorship of Cui Yan at Xuanhe “employed among its staff many prominent figures (mingshi), and of whom many advanced to important offices later”; the governorship of Wu Yuanheng at Xichuan was known to have “done its utmost to select the best at the time when it first commenced”; the governorship of Wang Zhi at Xuanhe which recruited “everyone who was prominent at the time”; and the governorship of Shen Zhuanshi at Jiangxi refused the request made by a Chief Minister on behalf of his relative for an ancillary post and “hence its staff included only the best at the time.”

Did the “newly risen class” really encroach upon provincial ancillary offices (henceforth it refers particularly to the top level as before)? To approach this issue, I choose to examine the composition of provincial ancillary personnel of individual provinces. The most appropriate provinces for such scrutiny would be the

...
provinces of the Jiang-Huai area that, being the most advanced region both in terms of agricultural production and circulating economy, served as the backbone of Tang finance. As it have been pointed out before, these provinces were where many local potentates, the so-called “land owner/wealthy merchant/local magnate,”78 resided and are said to have encroached upon the provincial power structure through “shadowy possession (yingzhan).”79 In this section, I choose the governorships of Huainan and Zhexi to represent the Jiang-Huai area as the subjects for my analysis of the composition of the provincial ancillary personnel. While Huainan was a province in the class of military governorship (also together with Xichuan and Hedong were known as the three important provinces to which the Chief Ministers flocked like the giant birds80), Zhexi was in the class of civil governorship. One reason for me to choose these two is to verify if their difference in class is reflected in the social background of the ancillary officials they recruited.

Next, in term of the method of analysis, I attempt to find as much information as possible on these ancillary personnel from official histories, literary collections, local gazetteers, and epitaphs, adding to the laborious work by Dai Weihua.81 The study focuses on the period beginning with the establishment of governorships after the An Lushan Rebellion and ending around the year 880 when the political power of the Tang court collapsed due to the Huang Chao Rebellion. Please refer to the attached lists of “The Personnel of the Ancillary Posts under the Huainan Governorship” (pp. 49-51) and “The Personnel of the Ancillary Posts under the Zhexi Governorship” (pp. 52-53) for information on the members of the governorships of Huainan and Zhexi with regard to their family background and eligibility of entering the officialdom (chushen). The kinds of family background and eligibilities of entering the officialdom are differentiated as follow. Here is an explanation of the lists including the symbols used.

With regard to the family backgrounds, I adopt the term “menfu aristocracy,” “junxing aristocracy,” and “shuxing” proposed by Denis Twitchett and Yoshioka Makoto.82

---

78 The influential view of the recent years suggests that the “newly risen class” of the time which was described as “local magnates (shahou)” refers not just to the major land owners, but also to the “class of managers of multiple industries” that had actively involved in circulating economy. See Osawa 1992 and 1993.

79 On the prevalence of “shadowy possession (yingzhan or yingbo),” please refer to Tanigawa 1952 and Matsui 1957.

80 Fanxuan wenji 10. “The Wall Inscription of the Administrative Hall of the Army Supervisor of Huainan” states that “[one] came [into this governorship] retired from the position of a Chief Minister and left promoted to the position of a Chief Minister” (p. 159).

81 See Dai 1994. In this book, Dai widely collected from all kinds of historical materials information on each and every holder of provincial posts in every province of Tang.

The so-called “menfa” refers to roughly 30 clans that were among the upper echelon of the aristocracy listed in Liu Fang’s “The Treatise on Clans” of the eighth century (XTS 199). They are as followed: (shows in the bracket are locales from which the clans originated (junwang), according to 《The Genealogical Tables of Chief Ministers》 in XTS and Lin Bao’s Yuanhe xing zan.

[Guanzhong Group] Wei (Jingzhao); Pei (Hedong); Liu (Hedong); Xue (Hedong); Yang (Hongnong); Du (Jingzhao, Xiangyang); Yuan (Henan); Zhangsun (Henan); Yuwen (Henan); Lu (Henan); Yuan (Henan); Dou (Henan, Fufeng); Li (Longxi, the Imperial Clan)

[Shandong Group] Wang (Taiyuan); Cui (Boling, Qinghe); Lu (Fanyang); Li (Zhaojun); Zheng (Yinyang)

[Jiangnan Group] Wang (Langye); Xie (Chenjun); Yuan (Chenjun); Xiao (Lanling); Zhu (Wujun); Zhang (Wujun); Gu (Wujun); Lu (Wujun)

Those tables and records of junwang include the description on clans and junwang of Taiping huanyu ji, Guang yun, and Dunhuang Documents, Beijing Wei. 79 and Stein 2052. With regard to the genre of junwang tables, please refer to Niida 1958, Ikeda 1959-60 and Yoshioka 1981.

However, I corrected the list by adding to the junxing aristocracy the Han clan of Changli and the Li clan of Liaodong, both of which had been socially recognized as the “aristocratic” since the previous dynasties; see XTS 71A, pp. 2859-72 and 72A, pp. 2503-6. In terms of the Han clan of Changli, please refer also to the episode in which Han Gao, whose father and grandfather were both Chief Ministers, said to the Wang Shuwen clique that “I would not serve the upstarts,” (JTS 129, p. 3604) or to Han Yu’s, who came from the Han clan of Yingchuan lineage, false claim of being from the Han clan of Changdi (see Takeota 1951, pp. 34-6). The Li clan of Liaodong was one of the Eight Pillars of the State (ba zhuguo) in the Western Wei and an illustrious clan of the Guanzhong Group.
The so-called “shuxing” refers to individuals whose family name and birth place do not match those in the junwang tables and records. They are to some degree overlapping with the so-called “newly risen class.”

Next, with regard to the methods of entering the officialdom, especially by the examinations, I used the mentioning of passing examination in epitaphs to supplement what is in Xu Song’s Dengke jikao and Meng Erdong’s Dengke jikao buzhen.

Conducting the task as such, I find there were a total of 132 ancillary officials in Huainan and 105 in Zhexi. Needless to say, I do not deny feeling that the number of people involved is very small in this period a little over a century. Even so, I believe the number is sizable for us to gauge the relatively general trend. Based on these data, I have arranged into the next two tables our information on the family backgrounds and the eligibilities of entering officialdom of the ancillary personnel of the Huainan and Zhexi governorships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table II</th>
<th>The Family Background of the Ancillary Officials of Huainan Governorship</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yin privilege</td>
<td>Menfa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exams (jinshi)</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total [%]</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table III</th>
<th>The Family Background of the Ancillary Officials of Zhexi Governorship</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yin privilege</td>
<td>Menfa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exams (jinshi)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(21)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total [%]</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen in these tables at least, what is clear from the first glance is the overwhelming advantage of the menfa aristocracy (accounts for 42% of the total in
Huainan and 40% in Zhexi) and the majority of those who were eligible for official assignments by ways of examinations (especially the jinshi exam) (accounts for 48% of the total [and 42% of that were jinshi graduates] in Huainan and 50% [and 44% of that were jinshi graduates] in Zhexi). Including those of juxing, which account for 21% in Huainan and 27% in Zhexi, the aristocratic classes took up roughly two third of the entire body of ancillary personnel who served in these two governorships. The percentage of the shuxing class is still low even if we consider that some of the personnel who came from unknown family background might belong to it. This fact suggests the assumption that the provincial ancillary post served as the ladder through which the “newly risen class” entered the officialdom cannot be substantiated. The following (Table IV) lists the percentage of people who were native of the Jiang-Huai region and served in these two governorships. In both Huainan and Zhexi, they account for only 14% of the total number. On top of it, in Huainan, only 6 out of the 18 persons belonging to the shuxing class were natives; and 6 out of 12 in Zhexi.

Table IV: The Provincial Ancillary Officials of the Huainan and Zhexi Governorships that were born in the Jiang-Huai Region (including Junwang of the Jiangzuo Group)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Menfa</th>
<th>Juxing</th>
<th>Shuxing</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total [%]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Huainan (born in Jiang-Huai/Total)</td>
<td>7/56</td>
<td>4/28</td>
<td>6/18</td>
<td>1/30</td>
<td>18/132 (14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhexi (born in Jiang-Huai/Total)</td>
<td>4/42</td>
<td>5/28</td>
<td>6/12</td>
<td>0/23</td>
<td>15/105 (14%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Needless to say, we have to consider the problem that the biases in the existing historical materials engendered. For example, the overwhelming majority of epitaphs belonged to members of the aristocracy. The chance of survival for any written material on a person of the “newly risen class” is indeed very low. However, what I would like to consider here is the fact that the jinshi examination, which had become the “dragon gate” to enter officialdom in the second half of the Tang, worked more to the benefits of the aristocracy. This is due to its content, which was based primarily in poetry — an aristocratic refinement, and due to the visible and invisible workings of various connections (guanjie)\(^\text{85}\) making

\(^{85}\) See Tang zhiyan 6, “Memorial of Wang Lengran in the Kaiyuan era,” p. 67. “Guanjie” in modern Chinese is “guanxi”. In TCB C (p. 56), we see that “to visit and entreat the powerful and important was referred to as ‘guanjie’.”
it different from what took place since the Song Dynasty. An example is the practice of “xingjuan (to circulate in advance one’s literary works among the examiners)” that influenced the examiner prior to the examination. In front of the narrow door of Tang examinations, “which appears to served as the reinforcement for the old aristocracy that was heading toward decline, instead of producing a new bureaucratic class,” those from obscurity (guhan) could do nothing other than swallowing their tears. As such, was it really easy for the “newly risen class” of a locality to barge into the rank of ancillary posts that had become part of the course of advancement extending from passing the examination as seen in the previous section?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table V</th>
<th>The Composition of the Essential Personnel of the Central Bureaucracy during the Mid-Tang (755-826)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reigns of Xianzong — Jingzong [805-826]</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

†data based on Watanabe 1993. The percentage in [ ] was that of exam graduates in each category who served as the essential personnel of the central bureaucracy.

In Table V, I outlined my analysis of the composition of the essential personnel of the central bureaucracy (i.e. the Chief Minister, President of the Board of Personnel, Vice-President of the Board of Personnel, Vice-President of the Board of Revenue as Financial Commissioner, Vice-President of the Board of Rites, Left and Right Supervisor of the Department of State Affairs (zuoyou cheng), Secretariat Drafts, Supervising Secretary, and the Hanlin Scholar) that should have been the finishing points of this course of advancement during the mid-Tang. Its characteristics are the shocking restoration of menfa aristocracy to power and the sharp increase in ratio of examination graduates. These data demonstrate that civil examination in the post An-Shi Rebellion era had served the interest of the menfa aristocracy as a footing that allowed it to shove the “newly risen class” aside and restore its influence. Also, the ratio of menfa, junxing, and shuxing in the composition of the essential personnel of the central bureaucracy

---

86 With regard to the Tang custom of “xingjuan,” please refer to Cheng 1980.
during the mid-Tang is astonishingly similar to that of the ancillary personnel of the Huainan and Zhexi governorships; so is the high ratio of examination graduates in the central bureaucracy. Taking these together, it may be proper to say that the results of the aforementioned analysis of the composition of the ancillary personnel in the Huainan and Zhexi governorships reflect the general trend.

I would like to pick up some non-menfa aristocrats who were native to the Jiang-Huai region and investigate their profile. Let us begin with the case of Liu Sanfu (see Appendix: Huainan 81 and Zhexi 64, 70) who was an example of talented men from obscure background being promoted by Li Deyu. Liu Sanfu was a native of the Jurong County in Runzhou. It is recorded that Liu had faithfully followed Li as a longtime subordinate (gulz) like a shadow following the body since he first brought his work to Li, then the governor of Zhexi, in the Zhangqing era (821-24) and was subsequently recruited. However, there is a historical source indicating that Liu was already the Defender of the Jintan County in Runzhou at the time of his recruitment, as well as an epigraphic source recording that he was previously the Executive Officer of Military Affairs (junshi panguan) of Chuzhou and the former Vice Director for Ceremonies in the Court of Imperial Sacrifices (taichang si fengli lang) during the latter years of the Yuanhe era (805-20). His case therefore shall not be interpreted as a commoner being recruited. Moreover, the JTS records that Liu “had lost his father when he was very young and was impoverished. His mother was ill and he had done his utmost to care for her with piety.” Since Guang yun listed the Liu clan as the juxing of the Danling Commandery, Runzhou, I think it is better to consider Liu Sanfu as one who came from the dwindling local aristocracy rather than from the “newly risen class” of his locale.

Next, Luo Rang (see Appendix: Huainan 62) was a native of the Kuaiji Commandery, Yuezhou. His father, Luo Xiang, was the Metropolitan Governor. Luo Rang passed the jinshi, boxue hongci which was one of the selective exams

---

88 See JTS 177, “The Biography of Liu Ye,” p. 4616 and that in the XTS 183, p. 5381. Li Deyu’s action of promoting men from obscure background became one of the evidence to support the claim on Li’s without faction; see Tang 1970 and Wang 1996. With regard to the history of scholarship and the various issues on the Niu-Li Factionalism, please refers to Watanabe 1994b, pp. 85-91.
89 TYL 3, “Praise,” p. 279.
90 QTZZCZ, no. 1013, “The Epitaph of Lady Li, née Liu of Guangping (AD 818).” Liu Sanfu, the author of the epitaph, was a distant nephew of the lady. As such he was a member of the Guangping Liu clan from which came Chief Ministers Liu Xiangdao and Liu Jingxian of the early Tang and a Chief Minister Liu Congyi of the mid-Tang.
Board of Personnel administered (libu kemu xuan) and decree exams, and became the Defender of the Xianyang District. As previously described, he left the officialdom for ten some years due to the death of his father and returned only at the earnest solicitation of Military Governor Li Yong. Though the Luo clan was seen as one of the shuxing, the case of Luo Rang too was not one that can be interpreted as a commoner being recruited overnight. Wu Dan (see Appendix: Zhexi 55), similarly came from a shuxing in Jiangnan, entered the officialdom as a jinshi graduate. His father was the Keeper of the Palace Gate of the Heir Apparent (taizi gongmen lang); grandfather was the Adjutant (sima) of Muzhou; and great grandfather was the Secretarial Receptionist for the Heir Apparent (taizi tongshi sheren). Luo Yin (see Appendix: Huainan 115), a late Tang poet, was a native of the Xincheng County in Hangzhou. His grandfather was the Magistrate of the Futang County in Fuzhou; and his father was a graduate of the exam based on Kaiyuan Rituals.

It is in this way that among the few provincial ancillary officials in the Jiang-Huai region who came not from the menfa aristocracy, we found no case that shows any trace of a "newly risen class" of the locality that sprang into the center of provincial power structure. Rather we found that even those who came not from the menfa aristocracy were recruited because their actions conveyed the value of the orthodox culture, such as the literary refinements or etiquette, that supported the rule of the Tang bureaucracy. However in Huainan and Zhexi, since Gao Pian served as the Military Governor at the end of Qianfu era (his appointment to that of Zhexi was just before Chang’an was sacked in the turbulence related to the Huang Chao Rebellion), there were examples of people who became ancillary officials coming from clearly noticeable "newly risen class." Gu Yun (see Appendix: Zhexi 96), who was a son of a salt merchant in Chaizhou, and Liu Yongzhi (see Appendix: Zhexi 97), "who was a native of Boyang and whose family were brokers for generations," are recognizable examples of these. It is well known that Liu Yongzhi led a group of "wicked men (yaoren)" that followed Gao Pian to Huainan, gradually monopolized the provincial administration and later forced Gao into a wretched end. In the recent years, Yamane Naoki also sees the

93 Wayne beihi 1, p. 45; Tang caizi zhuang 9, p. 112.
group of “wicked men” in connection with the members of a circulating economy, such as the lower level merchants, and describes that Gao’s attempt to re-organize the military and financial structure of Huainan in order to be self-sufficient in the decline of the Tang regime had resulted in their overnight rise in power. At any rate, the gaining force and rapid advancement of the “newly risen class” in the provincial power structure was built upon the collapse of the system that had hindered its rise in politics; in other words, it was caused by the collapse of the political and cultural orthodoxy centered on the Tang court, which was the bureaucratic order that had placed provincial ancillary posts on the course of advancement.

III. Career and “Connection” with regard to Informal Recruitment

If the provincial ancillary posts were the course of advancement in the officialdom in the second half of the Tang, what kind of people were truly the subjects of informal recruitment? In this section, I would like to investigate further into this matter. First, since the recruits for provincial ancillary posts were principally those who were eligible to enter the officialdom (you chushen zhe), jinshi exam graduates (whose future prospect was thought to be bright) became the recruitment target in numerous instances. It was the standard course of action to recruit recent jinshi exam graduates as provincial ancillary officials as seen in the memorial submitted by the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery in the first month of the

96 See Yamane 2000.
97 The decree of the sixth month of the Huichang 5th year (845) (THY 79, p. 1714) states, “Recently, most of the referrals to the ancillary posts or the prefectural and county posts by the various circuits are jinshi candidates (xianggong jinshi). But this practice was prohibited and must not be tolerated. Those who are not eligible to enter the officialdom shall not be employed. From now on, this practice will be prohibited forever.” The recruitment of jinshi candidates as well as mingjing candidates (who were recommended by their local authority to take the exams in the capital, which they didn’t subsequently pass) was a new trend in the late Tang (See Otagi 1973). However, I wonder if they could be appointed to the upper level ancillary posts. As will be described later, the newly risen class could only be appointed to the level of the prefectural and county officials or the lower level ancillary posts. Therefore, it is obvious that the ancillary posts referred to in the above decree are of lower level. The case of Wei Mao, which Otagi took as a typical example, was a recruitment for the prefectural supervisor (JXDF 9, “The Epitaph of Mr. Wei”). The case of Tao Piao, who was a jinshi candidate, was recruited as a yaoji, a low ranking post (QTW 778, “The credential for various ancillary posts written for Yingyang gong(Zheng Ya)”, by Li Shangyin, p. 9275).
98 As I already made clear in the previous section, the percentage of the provincial ancillary officials of Huainan and Zhexi who entered the officialdom through passing jinshi exam was very high. Among the 594 provincial ancillary officials whose method of entering officialdom has been identified by Wang Dequan, 309 were jinshi exam graduates; See Wang 1994.
Dazhong second year (848) during the reign of Xuanzong.99 However, while the regulation stipulates that a jinshi exam graduate must first serve as a local official for the length of two evaluations before he could be recruited for a provincial ancillary post under a governor or a commissioner of financial affairs, many did not observe the rule, judging from an edict issued in the Huichang second year (842) during the reign of Wuzong, which cited an earlier edict issued in 835.100 The fact that being recruited by a provincial governor was generally the set course for those who passed the jinshi exam is also demonstrated in the following case:

The second brother [of Lady Lu] named Yi succumbed to illness after passing the jinshi examination before he could be recruited by a provincial governor. He died in his home at Zhaoguo Ward.101

In view of this episode that Hu Sansing praised,

Bandits sacked Lizhou and killed its prefect Li Xun and the Executive Officer Huangfu Zhen. Huangfu had attempted to pass the jinshi examination twenty-three times to no avail; yet, Li recruited him. Huangfu escaped when the bandits attacked and sacked the city. He asked someone, “Did the prefect escape?” He was told that, “the bandit had captured him.” He said, “I have received [from Li] extraordinary acknowledgment, I can’t leave him now.” Huangfu returned to seek the bandits and died together with Li.102

we could tell that for a provincial governor (in this case a prefect) to recruit someone who did not have a jinshi degree was a show of extraordinary condescension;

99 The memorial submitted by the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery states that: “Starting with the first year of the Zhenyuan era (785) until the autumn and winter of the ninth year of the Taihe era (835), every jinshi exam graduate was given probationary office through the recommendation of the governor and became a staff member in the latter’s retinue.” THY 76, “Jinshi Examination,” pp. 1637-8.

100 The edict issued on the eighteenth day of the twelfth month in the Taihe 9th year states that: “Those who passed the jinshi exam shall first be appointed prefectural supervisors or defenders of an important district. None shall petition for them to serve [as provincial ancillary officials] until they have been twice evaluated. ... Recently, governors of various provinces have not observed this rule. They appointed to their staff those who should be occupying the prefectural posts.” See CFFG 632, “Bureaucratic Evaluation,” p. 7575.

101 See “The Epitaph of Lady Lu, nee Zheng of Yingyun (AD 858),” in Luoyang xinhua muzhi, p. 117.

102 ZZTJ 253, p. 8233.
henceforth, in such context, we could understand the motivation for Huangfu Zhen who risked his life to repay the kindness he had received. This next case in contrast,

Zhang Buyi consecutively passed the jinshi and the boxue hongci examinations. At that very same year, four provincial governors tried to recruit [him]. [They are] Vice Censor-in-Chief Li Ning of Jiangxi, Chief Minister Li Hui of Dongchuan, Chief Minister Li Shen of Huainan, and Presiding Minister [of the Department of State Affairs] Gui Rong of Shan’nan West. Theirs are all the most illustrious provincial governments.103

shows those jinshi graduates who also passed the boxue hongci exam which was regarded as the most difficult of the selective exams the Board of Personnel administered were very much in demand among those renowned governors.

Moreover, once entering a provincial government, a jinshi exam graduate would also receive preferential treatment when he was reviewed for acting, concurrent, or probationary posts. Whereas an edict (dated to the eighth day of the fifth month of the Taihe third year (829) during the reign of Wenzong, that was cited in a memorial submitted by the Grand Secretariat-Chancellery in the twelfth month of the same year) stated that:

In order to be considered for an acting, concurrent, or probationary post, especially that of Investigating Censor and of Attending Censor, the provincial ancillary official petitioned must have gone through no fewer than six evaluations as a regular official, even if he had acquired some relevant credentials. For the post of Attending Censor in the Palace, one must have gone through no fewer than nine evaluations; and for any post above the Attending Censor in the Palace, [one needs to go through] three more [evaluations].

However, in the same memorandum was also a request that,

Those who previously held the pure posts of the sixth rank and above in the central bureaucracy, or served as the supervisors of the Metropolitan areas of Henan and Jingzhao, or entered officialdom through passing either

or any of the other various exams, will not be subjected to this rule.

Graduates of jinshi and various other exams, especially the decree exams and the selective exams the Board of Personnel administered, received favorable treatment when accumulating credentials in the service of provincial governments. In other words, jinshi and various other exams were instrumentally tied to the informal recruitment, in a fashion similar to how the acting, concurrent, or probationary titles as (official credentials) were tied to the central bureaucracy through the system of Winter Recommendation.

Next, since informal recruitment was about personal contacts, there ought to be some examples of talented men from obscured background being promoted. However, in reality, it would not be hard to imagine that there were numerous cases in which connection (guanjie) had operated. In the following table, Table VI, I listed some cases that I found in various historical records.

Thus, I think personal connections of various kinds — such as being distant relations, in-laws, members of the same clan, former acquaintances, or even former patron and patronne — had strong influence at the scene of informal recruitment. Yao Kuang entreated his old friend Dugu Wensu, the Civil Governor of Hunan, to exercise influence on behalf of his son-in-law, Zhao Jing; the latter was then appointed the Executive Officer of Hunan. Dou Yu was recruited because he was the son-in-law of the powerful minister, Han Huang. Judging from these cases, the circumference of personal connections must have come to cover an even wider range for many people as their blood/marital relations and old acquaintances multiplied. As such, it should be obvious as a matter of course which class would be benefited by the informal recruitment. In other words, the beneficiary was no other than the aristocratic class — also the menza aristocracy that had exerted great influence — who had kept various connections through friends of previous generations or marital relations. In fact, Maeda Aiko points out that among the cases collected in the biographies of the two official Tang Histories about informal recruitment in the second half of Tang, the majority were of members of

104 The placement examination administered by the Board of Personnel was constituted of four parts: Appearance (shen), Speech (yan), Calligraphy (shu) and Judgment (pan). "Pingpan rudeng" has come to be understood as those who scored very high on Judgment. See Ichihara 1963, pp. 122-3.
105 "THY 79, “Miscellanea about the Various Commissioners,” p. 1710.
106 TPG1 152, "Zhao Jing Liu Hai (from Jiuhua hu)," pp. 1091-2.
### Table VI: Examples of Recruiting through Personal Contacts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Type of Connection</th>
<th>The Recruited</th>
<th>The Recruiting Governor/Province</th>
<th>The Relation of the Recruited to the Recruiting</th>
<th>The Primary Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>By Blood or Marriage</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lu Fan</td>
<td>Pei Ji/Qianzhong</td>
<td>Cousin (bianming)</td>
<td></td>
<td>STMZHB, Luoyang 13, p. 43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma Feng</td>
<td>Li Yuanming/E’yu</td>
<td>Brother-in-law (meizui)</td>
<td></td>
<td>THY 78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang Kun</td>
<td>Wang Zai/Hedong</td>
<td>Cousin (congdi)</td>
<td></td>
<td>BQJSJBZ 74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lu Jia</td>
<td>Lu Hongzuan/Dongchuan</td>
<td>Cousin (cong gianzu zongzi)</td>
<td></td>
<td>QTZZCZ 1118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhang Guan</td>
<td>Zhang Zhao/Qiangzhang</td>
<td>Clansman (zongren)</td>
<td></td>
<td>QTZZCZ 1161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jia Su</td>
<td>Jia Dan/Yicheng</td>
<td>Clansman (zongdang)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Duyang zubian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun Jingyu</td>
<td>Wei Zhengguan/Lingnan</td>
<td>In-law (swazi)</td>
<td></td>
<td>QTZZCZ 1178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Cui Maozao</em></td>
<td>Cui Yuanhao/Hedong</td>
<td>Cousin (zai cong kunzhong)</td>
<td></td>
<td>QTZZCZ 1194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Han Shou</td>
<td>Li Dang/Tiande</td>
<td>In-law (swazi)</td>
<td></td>
<td>QTZZCZ 1202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>By Interactions in the Officialdom</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du You</td>
<td>Wei Yuanfu/Zhexi</td>
<td>Son of old acquaintance (guren zhi sun)</td>
<td></td>
<td>JTS 147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dou Qin</td>
<td>Yu Di/Shan’nan East</td>
<td>Old acquaintance (guren)</td>
<td></td>
<td>CFYG 729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li Fan</td>
<td>Du Ya/East Capital</td>
<td>Son of old acquaintance</td>
<td></td>
<td>JTS 148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lu Yan</td>
<td>Unnamed</td>
<td>Son of old acquaintance</td>
<td></td>
<td>XTS 184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Yuanxin</td>
<td>Zhao Zongru/Shan’nan West</td>
<td>Patronage (mensheng)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yinhu lu 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li Hua</td>
<td>Zheng Ya/Shan’nan West</td>
<td>Grandson of the Patron (zaozhu zhi sun)</td>
<td></td>
<td>STMZHB, Beijing 2, p. 112</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Cui Maozao was an example of recruitment at the county level (as the Defender of the Jiaocheng county of Taiyuan).*

the Five Great Clans of Shandong (i.e. Boling/Qinghe Cui clans, Fanyang Lu clan, Zhaojun Li clan, Yingyang Zheng clan, and Taiyuan Wang clan) recruiting one another. In addition, a high percentage of jingshi exam graduates from the Five Great Clans were recruited by governors also from the Five Great Clans. In the end, was the system of informal recruitment not also built upon the network of

---

the aristocratic society?

Such network based on personal connections came to wield tremendous influence even in the central bureaucracy. For examples, Chief Minister Li Shi, who came from the Li clan of Longxi, recommended his own brother Li Fu at the discussion [between ministers and the emperor] in Yanying Hall; Chief Minister Liu Yuan of Pengcheng recommended Liu Zhan to the post of Hanlin Scholar because they were of the same clan; Chief Minister Liu Yuan of Pengcheng recommended Liu Zhan to the post of Hanlin Scholar because they were of the same clan; Chief Minister Dou Can of the Henan Dou clan nominated various kinsmen, such as Dou Shen and Dou Rong, for posts; Chief Minister Yang Shou from the Hongnong Yang clan transferred Li Chen of Longxi, for whom he had a match made in the previous year, first from Administrative Supervisor of the metropolitan area to the Defender of Chang'an District, then to the Executive Officer of the Militia Commissioner (tuanlian panguan) in Hunan as the Investigate Censor (jiancha yushi lixing) that summer, and then to the Director of the Imperial Library a year later. Other episodes, though special as they are about choosing sons-in-law, perhaps all the more plainly demonstrate the qualities that provincial governors made most of when appraising a person at the time. These qualities were

112 *JTS* 136, “The Biography of Dou Can,” p. 3747. Though Dou Shen was referred to in the biography as a “distant relative,” he was still an intimate of Dou Can. For Dou Can and those in his surrounding, please see Watanabe 1989, pp. 6-10. Moreover, one episode states that, “Linghu Tao often recommended those clansmen who came to him [for jobs] because there were so few in the rare clan. Henceforth relations of near and far all came [to him for jobs], including some whose last name was really Hu but [changed it by] adding the character ‘ling’ [in order to claim to be his relative]. Jiaoshi graduate Wen Tingyun poked fun of this in a poem. (It goes) ‘since the elder statesman [i.e. Linghu Tao] rose to prominence, every Hu [which also means ‘nomadic tribes’] in the world now obeyed the [Tang Empire’s] order [‘order’ in Chinese pronounced ling; it is a pun for the character ‘ling’ in Tao’s last name]. The case is interesting because it shows how the connection with a clansman played an effective role at the time.’ See *TYL* 7, “Addenda,” p. 648.
113 See *Guhe congzhao*, “The Epitaph of Zhang Zhongqi (AD 879),” p. 7622.
114 See *STMZHB*, Beijing Daxue 2, “The Epitaph of Lady Li, née Yuwen (AD 867),” p. 150.
115 Such as Yi Shen, the Governor of Anhuang, who was constantly looking for some young men from the illustrious clans to marry his daughters; and Li Changrong, the Governor of Heyang and later Zhaozi, who married his daughters to famous talented men of the day and appointed his sons-in-law to his own retinue. See *TGSB* A, p. 29.
whether one came from an “illustrious clan (mingzu)” and whether one gained contemporary acknowledgment (shiming) by passing either the jinshi or any other degree exam that served as the objective measure for one’s talent and literary ability.\textsuperscript{116}

In view of this, the astonishing similarity between the composition of the essential personnel in the central bureaucracy of the mid-Tang and that of the provincial ancillary personnel in Huinan and Zhexi shown above is most definitely not coincidental. In other words, the background and the initial credential of provincial ancillary officials, which were linked intimately to the central court, almost paralleled with those of important officials in the central bureaucracy. It is the menfa aristocracy that made most effective use of the course of advancement of the day — i.e. entered the officialdom through passing exams, then served as a provincial ancillary official (and built on his official credential while at it) and finally returned to the court. The system of recruiting provincial ancillary officials in the second half of the Tang like the jinshi examination, instead of being a ladder through which the “newly risen class” entered the officialdom, was after all one useful to the menfa aristocracy. I think it played a crucial role in supporting the revival of its political influence since the mid-Tang. This, I would say, is the most important significance of the provincial recruiting system.

IV. The System of Military Provinces and the Local Newly Risen Class

As seen above, provincial ancillary posts were closely connected to the management of government organization as a part of the elite course of advancement. If it served to restore the menfa aristocracy to power, where then did the much talked about encroachment of provincial power structure by the local “newly risen class” which began with the “shadowy possession” take place? This is a question I shall investigate in depth. Given my opinion based on a separate investigation of the lower level provincial ancillary officers, either the promotion of the “newly risen class” or the “shadowy possession” began at the rank of lower level provincial officers, such as military personnel, prefectural and county officials, and

\textsuperscript{116} In contrast, the following case demonstrates the evident misfortune of being a hanshi, who had neither any kind of personal connection in the officialdom, nor a jinshi degree. Emperor Xuanzong was so impressed by the memorial drafted by Tian Xun, the Chief Secretary of the Hezhong Governor Zheng Guang, he wanted to make Tian a Hanlin Scholar. However those who reviewed the case refuted it because Tian did not have a jinshi degree and no one supported him as he was from an obscure background. The emperor hence did not go forward with his plan. See FYL 3, “Praise,” p. 282.
clerical offices. Judging from the famous incident recorded in the “Amnesty proclaimed at the Southern Suburb (nanjiao shewen)” on the third day of the first month in the Huichang 5th year (845) of the Wuzong reign:

As for the migrant households (kehui) of the Jiang-Huai region and those who relocated to avoid household levy (hushui), while they should pay the summer or autumn taxes, they have been exempted from selective labor services. As for those among the myriad residents of each prefecture who have had an one-term office and who have moved to a neighboring prefecture upon the completion of their tenures serving the low ranking military or administrative posts at the provincial government, they represent themselves as the “official households (yiguan hu)”.

They have acquired much capitals and properties while paying taxes at a lower rate and are exempted from various selective labor services. They gradually sold everything they had at their home prefecture to resolve their household registration. Thus the number of those myriad residents who pay regular taxes (zhengshui) has decreased daily. In each prefecture and county, fewer are providing the various selective labor services.

From this point on, those among the myriad residents of Jiang-Huai region — with the exception of the jinshi graduates or the graduates of various exams — who have relocated to another prefecture after they have completed their term in office, will no longer represent themselves as the “official households.” Their levy on selective labor service will be the same as the common resident of the said prefecture.

Those who became the subject of prohibition by having avoided the selective labor services through “moving to a neighboring prefecture upon the completion of their tenures serving the low ranking military or administrative posts at the provincial government” were not “jinshi graduates or graduates of various exams.” In other words, they were not among the provincial ancillary officials composed of talented men who graduated from the jinshi examination. In fact, the aforementioned Amnesty also mentioned that:

Recently when each circuit petition for [local] appointments, the number

---

118 WYHY 429, p. 2175.
they requested have become so large that it not only encroaches on the authority of the Board of the Personnel but also opens the gate of nepotism. From this day onward, circuits including Huainan, Zhedong, Zhexi, Xuan­she, E’yue, Jiangxi, Jingnan, and Shan’nan East can no longer petition for [local] appointment. [... …] While in the past, military officers (junjiang) were often assigned to regular posts (shengshi) because of their distinguished services in war, from this day onward unless they have any distinguished service in war, they will not be assigned to regular posts.119

Here, the appointments that the various provincial governments in the Jiangnan region to which this prohibition was issued superfluously petitioned for were the prefectural and county offices that had become the subject of placement selection at the Board of Personnel and the military officers who had “no distinguished services in war.” The case of two “powerful [local] families (haojia)” “seeking magistrate posts” through bribing the eunuch who served as the Commissioner of Spring Clothing (chunyi shi) during Han Ci’s term as the Civil Governor of Guiguan (835–837)120 and that of He Zai of Dezhou in Hebei who through presenting strategies to the Military Governor Sir Cheng (Cheng Rihua?) of the Henghai Army was appointed the Executive Supervisor (lushi canjun) of Jingzhou and subsequently transferred to the Defender of Jingcheng County, the Vice-magistrate of Leling County, the Interim Magistrate of Leling County, the Military Assistant Staff (jiedu yaoji), Provisional Supervisor of Market Affairs (quan zhi shish),121 are notable examples of the kinds of the prefectural and county offices. According to the same epitaph, while He Zai’s junwang was the Lujiang Commandery, “the descendants have scattered and the He family now locates at the Ande County in Dezhou.” As he was buried in the Congxiao Township of Linjin County in Jingzhou that was close to the boundaries of Dezhou, it is perhaps better to recognize him as someone who was a local commoner.122 His last career, Military Assistant Staff was a low ranking ancillary post (as will be discussed below). And judging from the title of “Provisional Supervisor of Market Affairs,” we could presume the lowliness of its duties.

Next, on “military officers (junjiang)”:  

119 WYYH 429, p. 2174.  
120 JTS 161, “The Biography of Han Ci,” p. 3130.  
122 Though He Zai’s great grandfather was the Magistrate of Jiaocheng County in Ruzhou and his grandfather was the Executive Supervisor of Ruzhou, his father did not serve any official post.
I received the emperor’s kindness and was promoted to the Civil Governor of XuanShe from being the Mayor of Henan. [...] An Administrative Officer of Corps (yaya) named Li Weichen whose family was extremely wealthy had for years engaged in illegal and vile deeds and set up “shops (dian)”\(^{123}\) to gain profit and made commoners obey his orders. [...] Li’s son, Zicheng, was so malicious and infamous that the Administrative Officer of Corps-in-Chief (du yaya), Cui Jingneng, came to see me several times requesting earnestly that I punish Li strictly according to the laws. [...] Yu Xiong, the Commissioned Officer of Subjugation (taoji shi), constructed a stone lock gate which cut off the water supply for 130 families, taking it for his own use, and watering only his own field.\(^{124}\)

People like the Administrative Officer of Corps Li Weichen and the Commissioned Officer of Subjugation Yu Xiong surely existed as stated in the “Amnesty proclaimed at the Southern Suburb” issued in the Qianfu second year (875) of the reign of Xizong,\(^{125}\) and in Zheng Ji’s “The Record of Restoring the Southern Gate of the Prefectural Seat of Chuzhou.”\(^{126}\) Moreover, I think what had become the subject of advancement for the local “newly risen class” adding to these were the menial, lower level provincial ancillary offices. For example:

The name [of the tomb owner] was Cheng, [whose family] originated from Jincheng. [...] As the descendants of the family had decided to reside in Luzhou, they are now natives of Luzhou. [...] his] grandfather named Zhen was the Military Registrar of Memorials (jiedu biaozhuang kongmu guan), Concurrently Same as the Deputy Military Governor (jian tong jiedu jushz), Executive Official (changsht) of Zezhou, Acting Advisor to the Hair-Appar­rent (jianjiao taizi binke), Supreme of Pillar of the State (shang zhuguo) and was bestowed the purple court robe (cizt) and honorary fish pouch of gold.

---

\(^{123}\) “Dian” was usually referred to an inn that has a restaurant, a storage house (and sometimes even a bank). At some rural areas, there existed “dian” that collaborated with bandits selling stolen and prohibited goods. See Hino 1970. The “dian” mentioned here was also one that engaged in these illegal activities.


\(^{125}\) “Wealthy families in Jiangnan region where upon one’s gaining a military post the whole household is exempted from selective labor services, cause the poor to exile,” see Tang da zhaoling ji 72, p. 402.

\(^{126}\) “Selling government property at the marketplace and concealing family property by registering as military household,” see QTW 763, p. 9074.
His uncle named Gui was the Military Assistant Staff, Court Gentleman for Promoted Service (dengshi lang), Probationary Executive Official of the Right Capital Guard (shi you juanweii changshi), and the Right Supplementary Staff Placed According to Needs (you buchong jiedu zhuyao).127

As the “Registrar of Memorials” and “Military Assistant Staff” and “Right Supplementary Staff Placed According to Needs” for two generations under the governorship of Zelu, the father-and-son pair of Shentu Zhen and Gui was a notable example. The “Registrar of Memorials” was probably the registrar in charge of documents related to administration.128 Shentu Zhen was also the calligraphist of his father Huiguang’s epitaph, (recorded as Guang in the aforementioned epitaph of Shentu Cheng), and at that time Zhen’s titles were “the Military Assistant Staff of the Zhaoyi Army, Gentleman-Litterateur (wenlin lang), Probationary Supervisor of the Military Section of the Left Militant Guard (shi zuo wuwei bingcao canjun) and Supreme of Pillar of the State.129 Therefore, we can suppose that the Military Assistant Staff was a position lower than the Registrar among the lower level provincial ancillary officials.

Next, a Mr. Li served consecutively as the Irregular Express Courier (san qushi guan) (825), the Regular Express Courier (zheng qushi guan) (827–835), the Military Assistant Staff (838), and finally the Military Attending Officer (jiedu sui­jun) (year?).130 Express Courier, as suggests by its name I think, was a low official that carried out various miscellaneous services. Comparing to it, the Military Assistant Staff appeared to be of higher rank. At the time when the three North-
eastern provinces rebelled during the Jianzhong era, the Military Governor of Youzhou, Zhu Tao, named himself the King of Ji (jiwang) and changed the title of Express Courier and the Military Assistant Staff to Bearer of Orders (chengling). In the colophon of the Da bore boluo midou jing, inscribed in Fangshan, we can find Han Gongming who was the Military Assistant Staff (jiedu yaoji) and Executive Officer of the Governor’s Residence (shishi panguan). And in the epitaph of Cheng Junxin who served in the Pinglu province, we find his titles as the Military Assistant Staff and Accountant of Grains Office (zhiji hudou). Still more, the aforementioned office of Staff Placed According to Needs (zhuyao) of Shentu Gui, I think, is equivalent to that of the “quyao” mentioned in the epitaph of Xing Tong. While “quyao” was charged with maintaining the order, its role was to occupy the position next to the Registrar who was the manager of the general affairs.

In any case, the series of lower level provincial ancillary officials (i.e. Express Courier — the Military Assistant Staff — Staff Placed According to Needs — Registrar) were those who carried out the actual business of every minute provincial administration. In other words, they were menial positions. Clearly a line was drawn between them and the upper level provincial ancillary officials that were recruited from talents who had an eye on soon becoming court officials and were favorably treated as “guest staff”. We could grasp that there existed a qualitative difference.

[He] was promoted to be the Magistrate of Henan District. "□ xing (one letter missing)" customarily served in the military and became low ranking officers (junlu). Since the superior officers in the army were especially protective of them, the magistrate could not dismiss them from the service.

132 See the second part of the Fangshan shijing fiji huibian (p. 175). The Da bore boluo midou jing bears Han Gongming’s name at the end of juan 471 between the mention of “Shi Zaixing, the Prefect of Zhaozhou” in the beginning of juan 471 and that of “Zhang Yunshen, the Military Governor of Youzhou Lulong” in juan 472. As Shi Zaixing was a clansman of Governor Shi Yuanzhong (tenure 834-41) and Zhang Yunshen’s tenure started around 850s, I could deduce the date of Han Gongming. 133 See STMZHB, Jiangsu Shandong, “The Epitaph of Cheng Junxin (AD 878),” p. 137.
134 “[His] father named Xian, … was given the job of quyao in the provincial office of the governor, which governed six sections and ensured that everyone followed the rule.” See JZMYW, “The Jointed Epitaph of Xing Tong and His Wife (nee Pang) (AD 833),” p. 13652.
135 For details on the duties, statuses, and ranks of lower level provincial ancillary officials, please refer to Watanabe 2001.
However, Yang visited the military station in person and transferred all of them to “xiang [three letters missing].”

While various important characters are illegible, deducing from the characters of "□ xing" and "□ xing□□□□", this could be read as the removal of local magnates ("huoxing") from the junli positions to that of various leadership roles (zizheng, cunziheng) in village and township (xiang). The "junli" in this case is probably a name not only for military officers such as Administrative Officer of Corps, Commissioned Officer of Subjugation and so on, but also for lower level provincial ancillary officials such as Express Courier and Assistant Staff and so on.

Now, what is noticeable is that people who served as the rank and file prefectual and county officials (except the elite posts, such as the Defender of Metropolitan district), lower level provincial ancillary officials, and military officers, were from the same pool as demonstrated in these three cases: the aforementioned He Zai became the Military Assistant Staff from being prefectural and county officials such as the Prefectural Supervisor and County Magistrate; Liu Tan went from being an Express Courier, Vice Magistrate of Lucheng County in Cangzhou, Executive Registrar (kongmu panguan), Captain in Duty of Factory Affairs (zuolang jiang), Vice Magistrate of Lucheng County, to the Same as Deputy Commissioner of Frontier Management (tong jinglile fushi) and the Administrator under the General Commander of Corps (du zhi bingma shi yuan). Zheng Yu, a mingjing candidate who entered provincial government in his twenty, first became an Executive Registrar of the prefecture, then the Left Inspector (zuo yuhou) of the Tangxing Army, and finally the Inspector of Corps in Chief (du yuhou) after several transfers. Moreover, in the case of the aforementioned Military Assistant Staff Li, where as his grandfather was a Headquarter Commander (yaqian bingma shi), his eldest son was a Headquarter Guard (yaqian zidi), and his father-in-law was a Deputy Commissioned Officer of Subjugation at the Governor's Headquarter (jiedu yaqian taoji), and Bi Cen, son of the Defender of Xiabo County in Shenzhou, was a Military Staff Placed According to Needs of the Military Governor of Yiwu Province. In this manner, those who were prefectural and county officials, lower level provincial ancillary officials, and
military officials frequently appear to be either father and son or marital relations. This also goes to show that these three belonged to the same level in the hierarchy of bureaucratic organization in the second half of the Tang.141

It is worth noting that the Li’s family or Shentu father and son gained the lower level ancillary posts and military posts within one province. Mr. Li passed through the ancillary posts in the Zhenwu Province for thirty one years. The above-mentioned Liu Tan entered the provincial service as the Express Courier at 20 years old, passed through a number of the prefectural and county posts, lower level ancillary posts, and military posts all within the province of Henghai until he died at the age of 54. He Zai became the Supervisor of Jingzhou at 40 and held the prefectural and county posts or military posts in the Henghai Province successively for twenty seven years. So, it is clear that these posts have an indigenous aspect. This is quite a contrast to the cases of upper level ancillary officials, who held the posts temporarily as they were promoted to the court officials through the Winter Recommendation system, or transferred to the other provinces accompanying the governors.142

Now, I think I have presented a comprehensive view on the provincial ancillary posts in the late Tang. In short, they have two levels. One is the upper level provincial ancillary officials who were called the “guest staff” — the Executive Officer, Chief Secretary, Judge, Assistant Commissioner, Inspector, and etc. Another is the lower level officials who carried out the actual business of every minute provincial administration — i.e. Registrar, Staff Placed According to Needs of the Provincial Office of Zhenzhou and Executive Officer of Forest Management (shanchang wu panguan), then a Captain in Duty of Forest Management (shanchang jiang). He was given the posts of Deputy Commissioner of Frontier Management (jinglue jushi), then Superintendent of Forest Management (shanchang wu dashi guan), Defense Commander (zhengya bingma shi) of Raoyang Fortress in Shenzhou, and finally the Commander of Headquarter (yaqian bingma shi). And Zhen, the second son of Bian, was a Military Express Courier (jiedu qushi guan) and General Manager of Salt Warehouse (du yancang zhanzhi guan), and Nian, the third son, was an Express Courier of Governor’s Office (shiyuan qushi guan) and Chief of Personnel Affairs (zhi zhiyuan shi).

141 Zhongbian, the second son of the tomb owner in the previously discussed jointed epitaph of Xing Tong and his wife, was an Executive Officer of Lumbering Affairs at Beishan Forest (beishan chang caizhuo wu panguan). Zhongshou, the third son was the Sergeant of the Left Fengsheng Battalion [and] Auditors of Taxes of Seven Towns (zuo fengsheng jiang yaguan). This Zhongbian, I think, is also the Xing Bian of “The Jointed Epitaph of Xing Bian and His Wife (nee Zhou)” (AD 913). See STMZH, Hubei, p. 139. This epitaph states that Bian was first a Staff Placed According to Needs of the Provincial Office of Zhenzhou and Executive Officer of Forest Management (shanchang wu panguan), then a Captains in Duty of Forest Management (shanchang jiang). He was given the posts of Deputy Commissioner of Frontier Management (jinglue jushi), then Superintendent of Forest Management (shanchang wu dashi guan), Defense Commander (zhengya bingma shi) of Raoyang Fortress in Shenzhou, and finally the Commander of Headquarter (yaqian bingma shi). And Zhen, the second son of Bian, was a Military Express Courier (jiedu qushi guan) and General Manager of Salt Warehouse (du yancang zhanzhi guan), and Nian, the third son, was an Express Courier of Governor’s Office (shiyuan qushi guan) and Chief of Personnel Affairs (zhi zhiyuan shi).

142 Similar cases are too numerous to enumerate, one example would suffice to illustrate my point. Liu Sansu always attended Li Deyu, who took the post of the Zhexi governor thrice, and held posts of the Yicheng, Xichuan, and Huanan provinces accompanying Li (JTS 177, “The Biography of Liu Ye,” p. 4616).
Needs, Military Assistant Staff, Express Courier. There was a large gap between
the two levels. While the former was linked with the central bureaucracy and was
the ladder to the pure and important posts, the latter was indigenous and arose
from the same pool as certain military officers and low level local officials. In the
late Tang, the so-called “newly risen class” could only break into the lower level
of the provincial power structure.

Conclusion

Cui Xian of Boling was said to be the kind of person who was aspired to re-
tirement in mountain forest since young, and often traveled quietly to Mt. Nan for
days on end without return. When he reached twenty, he passed consecutively
several literary examinations. Poetry was his best. He was quite taken to drink-
ing. Whenever the wind and the moon were quiet and lonely, he would recite
poetry at length. Often he would become desolated, shed tears and would not
stop reciting until he was quite drunk.143 However, famous ministers, such as
Zheng Yuqing and Li Yijian, “recruited him to serve in their provincial govern-
ments and treated him as a teacher and a friend.”144 Du Mu, who was recruited by
Niu Sengru to serve in Yangzhou of the Huainan province, “did only his duties and
indulged in the banquets.” Though he lived a rather dissipated life, he was
apparently under the protection of Niu, who favored his talents.

What episodes like these demonstrate is the kind of worth that was respected
in the retinue of provincial governors and in establishing the politically orientated
personal connections behind the informal provincial recruitment. These are talents
in “Literature”, which was represented by writing poetic verse and parallel prose,
and by the command of an admirable range of precedents based on Confucian
cultivation and scholarship. Needless to say, these are the talents of cultural values.
In reality, “Literature,” such as drafting of memorials and documents of various
kinds, composing of poetry when receiving emissaries from the court and other
provincial governments, was a significant part of a provincial government’s daily
operation. Dai Weihua has thoroughly discussed how the provincial government
had become the place where rich literature was produced as literati became
friends at both the public and private parties and composed poems in response to
one another.145

144 TPGJ 373, “Du Mu (from Tang queshi),” p. 2151.
The understanding of the “newly risen class” as economic strongmen who steadily rose in power and readily entered central bureaucracy in the second half of the Tang using the informal recruitment system as the ladder was perhaps too simple. On this point, I find using Pierre Bourdieu’s theory on reproduction as a way to approach the politics and social structure of the second half of the Tang (and that of the Imperial China) attractive. The basis of Bourdieu’s theory on reproduction is not the economic capital that had thus far served as the center of class-consciousness. Rather it is the cultural as well as social capitals that play a more significant role in reproducing the elite class. To Tang elite, who had moved to reside in the two capital cities far away from their financial basis in their native provinces and had lost most of the self-evident political privileges due to the abolishment of the nine-rank system, cultural capitals (such as “Literature,” Confucian cultivation and etiquettes) and social capitals (cultivated through the unrelenting practice of intermarrying within the same social rank, as well as through social intercourse in the officialdom for generations) were their last weapons. The purpose of civil examination system was primarily to promote talented men regardless of their social background; however the aristocratic class came to seize the system, especially in the second half of the Tang. The civil examination in fact became a ladder that led to high ranking offices for the aristocrats. Moreover, they turned “Literature” (that was taken as the yardstick of civil examination and therefore the representation of the distinction between oneself and others) into the tool for distinction. Moreover, the [examinee’s] semi-open maneuver to solicit pat-

\[1\] Bourdieu 1979. In Japan, the attempt to introduce Bourdieu’s theory on reproduction to the studies of Chinese history was stimulated by Elman 1991 which covers Ming and Qing history (see also the all-inclusive later work of Elman 2000). Its influence can be seen in Hirata Shigeki’s study of Song civil examinations and bureaucracy (Hirata 1997, 1998), in which “network” served as the key concept, as well as in Watanabe Yoshihiro’s argument that the possession of various cultural values served as the basis for “eminent personnage” (Watanabe 1995, 2003). The latter argument is especially very interesting, as it suggests that the very possession of the cultural values, such as learning in Confucian classics, literature, historiography, may inherently define the social status of “aristocracy.”

\[2\] On the aristocrats’ insistence on practicing intermarriage within the same social rank in the second half of the Tang, see Otagi 1987.

\[3\] Liu Fen, whose biography was included in the Records of Literary Circle (wenyuan), was erudite and wrote well. After he passed the jinshi examination, he shocked the court by submitting to the decree exam (AD 828) an essay that criticized eunuchs severely. He was recruited by Linghu Chu (the governor of Shan’nan West) and Niu Sengru (the governor of the Shan’nan East) to serve as a provincial ancillary officer and treated as a “teacher and friend” (JTS 190, pp.5064-7). Similar to the aforementioned case of Cui Xian, the reason why a relationship like this could be established between a governor and a member of his retinue was that a sympathy existed between them as
from ministers prior to the event characterizing the Tang civil examination restored the political influence of the aristocracy in the second half of the Tang. And the social capital preserved by the aristocratic class was put to thorough use there. It was certainly that as Tonami Mamoru suggests: “[Tang civil examinations] appeared to have served as the reinforcement for the old aristocracy that was heading towards decline, instead of producing a new bureaucratic class.” As such, to the aristocratic class, the provincial informal recruitment system also had the function of reproducing its status as political elite. The informal recruitment of the Tang, both as an elite course of advancement in the officialdom and as a system that attached great importance to “Literature,” was in a sense a brother of the civil examination of the Tang. In addition to cultural capital, social capital (i.e. personal connection of various kinds) was more strongly effective at the informal recruitment than at the examination.

A bizarre phenomenon appeared in the second half of the Tang when the aristocratic class regained the power at the center of the officialdom using both the civil examination and the informal recruitment. The year 881, approaching the end of Tang, when the menace of the Huang Chao Rebellion was still at its greatest, Zheng Congdang, who was a Chief Minister assigned to the post of the Military Governor of Hedong, recruited prominent figures — Deputy Director of the Bureau of War and Compiler at the Historiography Institute (shiguan situzhuan), Liu Chonggui; former Deputy Director of the Bureau of Honorific Titles (sixun yuanei lang) and Compiler at the Historiography Institute, Zhao Chong; Magistrate of Chang’an District, Wang Dao; former Left Remembrancer (zuo shiyi), Li Wo — to be his administrative staff. “The staff he built his government with was so great, that it was the best at the time. Those who admired it at the court referred to Taiyuan (the seat of Hedong province) as the ‘petite court.’”

In the year 888, Wei Zhaodu, the Military Governor of Xichuan, when becoming the Commissioner of Pacification Commanding the Mobile Force (xingying zhaotao shi) to subdue Chen Jingxuan who occupied Chengdu, recruited the Military Governor of the Shan’nan West (Yang Shoulang) as the Deputy Commissioner, and they shared the same cultural values. I want to treat the system of provincial recruitment as the loci where the perception of the distinction produced by this cultural as well as the historically condensed identity indicator, i.e. aristocrat, was domanative. When we adopt this viewpoint, it seems possible to understand why the governors of this period treated provincial ancillary officers favorably as guests, though at first glance this phenomenon was anachronistic.

150 ZZTJ 257, p. 8383.
the Military Governor of Dongchuan (Gu Yanlang) as the Camp Adjutant. The situation was such that "those recruited as administrative staff by these three military governors were all sons or brothers of prominent figures at the court."151

Episodes such as these clearly demonstrate the aristocraticism that dominated the provincial informal recruitment system. But this aristocraticism could not exist without the Tang Dynasty, which authorized the bureaucratic system that was the nucleus of the centripetal force for the regular officials at the court, and the "Literature" that was the yardstick of cultural values. As such, once the Tang court and its bureaucratic organs disintegrated, aristocraticism along with its political hegemony suffered the ruinous fate as the final afterglow of the aristocratic society. "Sons and brothers of prominent figures at the court," who laughed at Wang Jian (who was a betrayer of the Huang Chao Rebellion and appointed to the Commander-in-Chief of the Mobile Force at the time) and his vulgar followers, were acting anachronistically. Such anachronism was mercilessly eradicated when Wang Jian murdered his ridiculers upon becoming the autocrat of Sichuan. Thence from the end of the Tang and throughout the Five Dynasties, the "sons and brothers of prominent figures at the court", who had served as "frivolous administrative staff"152 completely retreated from the political stage and were replaced through the system of informal recruitment by "the newly risen class" that was the real former body of the Song scholar-official class. 153

151 TPG 266, “Wang Xianzhu was ridiculed by the frivolous (from Bei meng suoyan),” p. 2091.
152 ibid.
153 The typical example is Feng Dao, who was recruited as the caoguan (equivalent to the Supervisor) under the governor Liu Shouguang in Yunzhou. After Liu went to ruin, Feng was offered the post of Inspector in Hedong Province (Jiu Wu dai shi 126, p. 1655. Xin Wu dai shi 54, p. 412). Another example is the ancestry of the Song eminent minister Han Qi. Han Yibin was a Military Executive Officer. His first son, Dingci, was a Civil Executive Officer. His second son, Changci was a magistrate and his son, Gou, was a prefect. His son Gouhuai, who was Han Qi's father became a jianshi graduate in the early Song. See Anyang ji 46, pp. 490-3. and Song shi 277, p. 10221.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>province</th>
<th>term of office</th>
<th>no.</th>
<th>name</th>
<th>auxiliary post</th>
<th>birthplace</th>
<th>gender</th>
<th>position</th>
<th>table of Janus</th>
<th>death</th>
<th>sources</th>
<th>remiters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>男</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>沧</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>陳</td>
<td>州</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>女</td>
<td>河南</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Personnel of the Ancillary Posts under the Huainan Governorship (756-789)
note

i) The column of birthplace includes junwang. When one's birthplace is different from junwang, generally adopt the former.

ii) The column of decent: (‡Bƒjrne(S(Œ³jshuxing tables of junwang):

iii) The column of method: .=jinshi =mingjing .... =zhike =zhuke

The time of official entrance is based on the data in Dengke jikao and Dengke jikƒÖbuzheng implemented with the data in the epitaphs.

iv) Sources

 [...]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>府号</th>
<th>姓氏</th>
<th>名前</th>
<th>拼音</th>
<th>籍貫</th>
<th>常居所</th>
<th>職務</th>
<th>職務職名</th>
<th>留日年月</th>
<th>留日所</th>
<th>留日理由</th>
<th>その他</th>
<th>退去年月</th>
<th>退去理由</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>水原家</td>
<td>井上正</td>
<td>jinpo</td>
<td>井原</td>
<td>井原</td>
<td>兵部</td>
<td>兵部省</td>
<td>1870年</td>
<td>独立國</td>
<td>近代化</td>
<td>1872年</td>
<td>旧制下</td>
<td>1872年</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>古川家</td>
<td>佐藤武</td>
<td>saito</td>
<td>古川</td>
<td>古川</td>
<td>兵部</td>
<td>兵部省</td>
<td>1871年</td>
<td>独立國</td>
<td>近代化</td>
<td>1873年</td>
<td>旧制下</td>
<td>1873年</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>佐藤家</td>
<td>松本義</td>
<td>mitsunobu</td>
<td>佐藤</td>
<td>松本</td>
<td>兵部</td>
<td>兵部省</td>
<td>1872年</td>
<td>独立國</td>
<td>近代化</td>
<td>1874年</td>
<td>旧制下</td>
<td>1874年</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Personnel of the Ancillary Posts under the Zhexi Governorship (756–879)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>埼男生</th>
<th>职位</th>
<th>出生地</th>
<th>死亡地</th>
<th>出生年</th>
<th>死亡年</th>
<th>备注</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>柴田</td>
<td></td>
<td>未详</td>
<td>未详</td>
<td>未详</td>
<td>未详</td>
<td>未详</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

注：具体信息待查。
### Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chinese</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Pinyin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>安德</td>
<td>Ande</td>
<td>Ōnde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>安黄</td>
<td>Anhuang</td>
<td>Æn-hhuang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>八隅</td>
<td>Bajun</td>
<td>Ō-hyu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>榻使郎官</td>
<td>Bashilangguan</td>
<td>Tā-sī-lāng-guān</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>八柱国</td>
<td>Ba Zhuguo</td>
<td>Ō-hō-jugokoku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>北山梁操務判官</td>
<td>Beishan Liang Cao Wuban Guan</td>
<td>Hē-bīshān-liāng-cāo-wù-bān-guān</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>北岑</td>
<td>Bicen</td>
<td>Bīchēn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>碧记</td>
<td>Biji</td>
<td>Óbì-jì</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>碧召</td>
<td>Bizhao</td>
<td>Óbì-zhāo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>邊章簡</td>
<td>Bian Zhangjian</td>
<td>Ōmēn-chāng-jian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>汴州</td>
<td>Bianzhou</td>
<td>Ō-hsien</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>表兄</td>
<td>Biaoxiong</td>
<td>Ō-ho-pō-hyō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>表狀宫</td>
<td>Biaozhuang Guan</td>
<td>Ō-hu-tsūkōng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>宾寮</td>
<td>Bingliao</td>
<td>Ō-hin-ryō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>宾佐</td>
<td>Binxiao</td>
<td>Ō-hin-san</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>博陵崔</td>
<td>Boling Cui</td>
<td>Bō-lyōng-Cūi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>博学宏詞</td>
<td>Boxue Hongci</td>
<td>Bō-xue-hōng-shī</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>鄭陽</td>
<td>Boyang</td>
<td>Ō-šēng-yōng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>博州</td>
<td>Bozhou</td>
<td>Bōshōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>补闕</td>
<td>Buque</td>
<td>Bō-hušū</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>泗州</td>
<td>Caizhou</td>
<td>Sè-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>参軍</td>
<td>Canjun</td>
<td>Ō-shen-jūn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>参謀</td>
<td>Cangmou</td>
<td>Ō-shan-mō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>滄州</td>
<td>Cangzhou</td>
<td>Ō-chāng-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>曹官</td>
<td>Caojun</td>
<td>Ō-sū-gūn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>常參官</td>
<td>Changsan Guan</td>
<td>Ō-kō-sān-gūn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>長漢</td>
<td>Chang Han</td>
<td>Ō-tō-gan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>長史</td>
<td>Changshi</td>
<td>Ō-to-shi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>陳敬策</td>
<td>Chen Jingcui</td>
<td>Ō-mon-kō-shē-u-ke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>陳郡</td>
<td>Chenjun</td>
<td>Ō-kō-mu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>陳許</td>
<td>Chenxu</td>
<td>Ō-kō-kō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>成德</td>
<td>Chengde</td>
<td>Ō-su-deru</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>成君信</td>
<td>Cheng Juxin</td>
<td>Ō-su-ki-shin-ten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>承令</td>
<td>Chengling</td>
<td>Ō-su-ki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>程日華</td>
<td>Cheng Rihua</td>
<td>Ō-su-ki-hata</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>赤縣</td>
<td>Chixian</td>
<td>Ākkyō-ken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>池州</td>
<td>Chizhou</td>
<td>Ō-kˌi-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>出身</td>
<td>Chushen</td>
<td>Čū-shin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>趙州</td>
<td>Chuzhou</td>
<td>Ō-kˌi-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>楚州</td>
<td>Chuzhou</td>
<td>Ō-kˌi-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>春衣使</td>
<td>Chunyi Shi</td>
<td>Ō-kˌi-yi-shi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>慈州</td>
<td>Cizhou</td>
<td>Ō-kˌi-zhōu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>賜紫</td>
<td>Cizi</td>
<td>Ō-ki-zu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>從高祖兄</td>
<td>Cong gaozu xiong</td>
<td>Tōkō-gau-su-ki-shō</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>人物名</td>
<td>职务</td>
<td>省市</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dou Rong</td>
<td>組長</td>
<td>高士</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dou Shen</td>
<td>資申</td>
<td>高麗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dou Yu</td>
<td>資銀</td>
<td>孤零</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Mu</td>
<td>杜牧</td>
<td>故吏</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Yaya</td>
<td>杜亞</td>
<td>Gu Yanlang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du You</td>
<td>杜佑</td>
<td>觀察判官</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Du Yuaning</td>
<td>杜元鏡</td>
<td>觀察遷官</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>du yuanying</td>
<td>杜元頤</td>
<td>觀察支使</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duan Wenchang</td>
<td>段文昌</td>
<td>Du Mu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dugu Wenss</td>
<td>竇柯同俗</td>
<td>guoshi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E'youe</td>
<td>鄭岳</td>
<td>Gao Xiyu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E'zhou</td>
<td>鄭州</td>
<td>gulin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fance</td>
<td>反閑</td>
<td>guren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fanyang Lu</td>
<td>范陽盧</td>
<td>Gu Yanlang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fanyang Zhang</td>
<td>范陽張</td>
<td>觀察判官</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fanzhen</td>
<td>范鎮</td>
<td>觀察遷官</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fangyu</td>
<td>防禦</td>
<td>觀察支使</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fe'fu</td>
<td>赤服</td>
<td>Du Mu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feni'ning</td>
<td>鼎寧</td>
<td>Gu Yanlang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feng Dao</td>
<td>汾道</td>
<td>觀察遷官</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feng Su</td>
<td>汾宿</td>
<td>觀察支使</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fu dashi zhi</td>
<td>副大使知節度事</td>
<td>田文</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jiedu shi</td>
<td>李廣</td>
<td>高士</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fu fashiyouan guan</td>
<td>府法衙院官</td>
<td>haoxing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Futeng</td>
<td>扶風</td>
<td>Hedong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fu lushi canjun</td>
<td>附錄事參軍</td>
<td>Hemeng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Futang</td>
<td>福唐</td>
<td>Henan Dong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fu Zai</td>
<td>符載</td>
<td>He Shigan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gao Pian</td>
<td>高壁</td>
<td>Heyang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gao Qu</td>
<td>高壘</td>
<td>He Zai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guanzhi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guan}ze</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>guanzhong</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dugui Wensu</td>
<td>筱異同俗</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dugu Wensu</td>
<td>筱異同俗</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hezhong  河中  jiedu yaqian taoji fushi
Henghai  横海  jiedu yaoji
hongyi  宏毅(词)  jiedu yaqian  jiedu yaoji
hongfu qing  鸿福卿  jiedu zhang shuji
Hongnong Yang  弘农杨  jincheng  金城
Hu Sanxing  胡三省  jinfeng  咸奉
hushui  户修  jinshi  進士
Hu Zhen  胡震  jintan  金壇
Huxi  淮西  jinxian  約縣
Hui’an  淮南  jinyu  金魚
Huaizhou  懐州  jinzhou  晋州
Huangfu Zhen  黃福震  jingcheng  景城
Hun Jian  滬県  jingli shi  經略使
ji cheng  藤程  jingnan  萬南
jishu  記書  jingwei  京尉
jishizhong  給事中  jingzhou  華州
Jiwang  冀王  Jingzhou  華州
ji wei  藤尉  Jurong  旬容
Jiaceng  鄚城  juncao si kongmu guan  軍曹司孔目官
Jia Dan  賈北  junjiang  軍籍
Jia Su  賈斯  junli  軍吏
jian  漢  junshu  軍書
jiancha yushu  監察御史  junshi  軍史
jiancha yushu lixing  監察御史裏行  junwangs  軍望
jiujiangao  儘校  junxing  軍姓
jiujiao taizi binke  儘校太子賓客  kai  考
Jiangzou  江左  kehu  客戶
jaoshu lang  校書郎  Kong Kan  孔倉
jiedu biaozhuang kongmu guan  kongmu guan  孔目官
jiedu canmou  翦度參謀  kongmu guan  孔目官
jiedu fushi  翦度副使  kuaiji  會稽
jiedu panguan  翦度判官  Lantian  郎田
jiedu quski guan  翦度曩管  Langye  琅邪
jiedu saijian  翦度縣官  langzhong  郎中
jiedu taiguan  翦度推官  lantian  郎田
jiedu xunzuan  翦度巡官  langzhong  郎中
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Nickname</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Leling              | Lihu kemu xuan | 吴陵 | 江苏省
| Li Changrong        | 李长荣   | 江苏省
| Li Chen             | 李畅     | 江苏省
| Li Dang             | 李聃     | 江苏省
| Li Deyu             | 李德裕   | 江苏省
| Li Fan              | 李藩     | 江苏省
| Li Fangxuan         | 李方玄   | 江苏省
| Li Fu               | 李福     | 江苏省
| Li Guyan            | 李固言   | 江苏省
| Li Guanbi           | 李光弼   | 江苏省
| Li Hua              | 李绘     | 江苏省
| Li Hui              | 李绘     | 江苏省
| Li Jiù              | 李济     | 江苏省
| Li Leng             | 李陵     | 江苏省
| Li Mian             | 李勉     | 江苏省
| Li Ning             | 李凝     | 江苏省
| Li Qi               | 李祈     | 江苏省
| Li Shangyin         | 李商隐   | 江苏省
| Li Shen             | 李伸     | 江苏省
| Li Shi              | 李石     | 江苏省
| Li Weizhen          | 李维翼   | 江苏省
| Li Wo               | 李沃     | 江苏省
| Li Xiyun            | 李栖筠   | 江苏省
| Li Xun              | 李Modificar | 江苏省
| Li Yue              | 李约     | 江苏省
| Li Yuezhang         | 里正     | 江苏省
| Lizhou              | 淮州     | 江苏省
| Liaoqiong Li        | 青东李   | 湖南
| Linjin              | 临津     | 湖南
| Linghu Chu          | 令狐楚   | 湖南
| Linghu Tao          | 令狐陶   | 湖南
| Lingnan             | 静安     | 湖南
| Liu Chonggui        | 劉崇寔   | 湖南
| Liu Congyi          | 劉從一   | 湖南
| Liu Fang            | 劉芳     | 湖南
| Liu Fen             | 劉藩     | 湖南
| Liu Gongchao        | 劉公焯   | 湖南
| Liu Jingxian        | 劉景先   | 湖南
| Liu Shouguang       | 劉守光   | 湖南
| Liu Tan             | 劉談     | 湖南
| Liu Xiandao         | 劉祥道   | 湖南
| Liu Yuan            | 劉瑗     | 湖南
| Liu Yuanzuo         | 劉元佐   | 湖南
| Liu Ye              | 劉靉     | 湖南
| Liu Zhan            | 劉瞻     | 湖南
| Li Zhongyi          | 劉仲郢   | 湖南
| Longxi Li           | 龍西李   | 湖南
| Lu Cheng            | 魯成     | 湖南
| Lu Congshi          | 魯從史   | 湖南
| Lu Fan              | 魯縧     | 湖南
| Lu Hongqian         | 魯弘寲   | 湖南
| Lu Hongzi (zheng)   | 魯弘芷 (zheng) | 湖南
| Lu Jiappo           | 魯簡邦   | 湖南
| Lu Liu              | 魯類     | 湖南
| Lu Lu               | 魯類     | 湖南
| Lu Shang            | 魯尚     | 湖南
| Lu Shangzi          | 魯尚子   | 湖南
| Lu Shangzi (zheng)  | 魯尚子 (zheng) | 湖南
<p>| Ma Feng  | 马锋  | shanchang jiang | 山場 僑  |
| meixiu  | isValid: true, value: 姬秀  | shanchang wu duzhi guan | 山場 勢都知管 |
| menfa   | 门阀  |  | 山門務都知官 |
| mensheng| 門生 | shanchang wu panguan | 山場 勢判官 |
| mingqing| 明經  |  | 山場 勢判官 |
| mingshi | 名士  | Shan’nan  | 山南  |
| mingzhu| 名族 | Shanggao  | 商號  |
| mengin | 幕賔  | shang zhuguo | 上柱國  |
| muli    | 幕吏  | she anfu xinguan | 攝安撫巡官  |
| mezhi guan | 幕職官 | she jiedu fushi | 攝節度副使  |
| Muzhou  | 睦州  | she tuanlian panguan |  |
| nanjiao shewen | 南郊 數文 |  | 攝閤 番判官  |
| Niu Hui | 牛徽  | Shentu Cheng  | 申屠成  |
| Niu Sengru | 牛僧孺 | Shentu Gui  | 申屠珪  |
| panguan | 畋官  | Shentu Huaguan  | 申屠 暢光  |
| Pei Du  | 裴度  | Shentu Zhen  | 申屠 賦  |
| Pei Ji  | 裴佶  | Shen Yazi  | 沈亞之  |
| Pei Jie | 裴洄  | Shenzhou  | 深州  |
| Pei Yi  | 裴彝  | Shen Zhaanshi  | 沈贊師  |
| Pengcheng Liu | 彭城劉 | shi | 試  |
| Pinggu | 平盧  | shi  | 士  |
| pingshan rudeng | 平善 等 | shiguang xizhuan | 史館 修撰  |
| Poyang | 鄱陽  | shining | 時名  |
| qicheng shixue guangshi | 七城 程學公事 | shi you jinwewei changshi | 試右 金衛長史  |
| qin lang | 起郎  | shiyu | 侍御  |
| Qianzhong | 千中  | shiyu | 侍御  |
| qinshi | 親事 | shiyu | 侍御史  |
| qingguan | 清官  | shiyuan qushi guan | 使院驅使官  |
| Qinghe Cui | 清河崔 | Shi Yuanzhong | 史元忠  |
| qingwuang guan | 清望官 | Shi Zaixin | 史再新  |
| qushi guan | 驱使官 | shizhai panguan | 使宅驅判官  |
| quyao | 驱要 | shi zuo wuwei bingcao canjun |  |
| quan zhi shishi | 權知 事  | shizhai panguan | 使宅驅判官  |
| Ruzhou | 河州  | shu | 河  |
| Runzhou | 淮州  | shuxing | 河姓  |
| san qushi guan | 散驅使官 |  |  |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>shuzhuang kongmu guan</th>
<th>waiyu</th>
<th>waiyu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Bo</td>
<td>Wang Bo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Dan</td>
<td>Wang Na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Dao</td>
<td>Wang Liu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Gong</td>
<td>Wang Qiao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Jian</td>
<td>Wang Jian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Kun</td>
<td>Wang Kun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Qi</td>
<td>Wang Qiao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Shuwen</td>
<td>Wang Shiwen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Wujun</td>
<td>Wang Wujun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Zai</td>
<td>Wang Zai</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wang Zhi</td>
<td>Wang Zhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Weibo</td>
<td>Weibo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Chan</td>
<td>Wei Chan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Jungjing</td>
<td>Wei Jungjing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Mao</td>
<td>Wei Mao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Mo</td>
<td>Wei Mo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Yuanfu</td>
<td>Wei Yuanfu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Zhaodu</td>
<td>Wei Zhaodu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wei Zhongguan</td>
<td>Wei Zhongguan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Weiizuo</td>
<td>Weiizuo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>wenji</td>
<td>wenji</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>wenlin lang</td>
<td>wenlin lang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wen Tingyun</td>
<td>Wen Tingyun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wen Yaoqing</td>
<td>Wen Yaoqing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>wenyun</td>
<td>wenyun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wujun</td>
<td>Wujun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wuning</td>
<td>Wuning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wu Shaoyang</td>
<td>Wu Shaoyang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wu Wuling</td>
<td>Wu Wuling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Wu Yuanheng</td>
<td>Wu Yuanheng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xichuan</td>
<td>Xichuan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xiabo</td>
<td>Xiabo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xiazhou</td>
<td>Xiazhou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xiangguan</td>
<td>Xiangguan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xianyang</td>
<td>Xianyang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>waiyu</td>
<td>Xiang</td>
<td>Xiang</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
xianggong jinshi 鄉貢進士
xianggong mingjing 鄉貢明經
xiangnu tili 相農體例
xiangyang 襄陽
xincheng 新城
xing bian 鄉汴
xingjuan 行卷
xingjun sima 行軍司馬
xing tong 鄉通
xingwang 鄉望
xingying zhaotao shi 行營招討使
xiong bian jiedu zhuyao 習兵副職要
xiong xin xing yin zhe 福新興銀折
xiang tong 行通
xiangzhong bian 習中邊
xunzi ge 徐資格
yuqian bingma shi 衛前兵馬使
yuqian zidi 衛前子弟
yujun 牙軍
yutai 衛台
yuya 衛衙
yanying 約英
yang shou 楊守
yang shouliang 楊守亮
yang sifu 楊嗣武
yang songnian 楊松年
yao zii 要籍
yao kuang 燹光
yuanren 原人
yicheng 義城
yiguan hu 衣冠戶
yi shen 伊幟
yi wu 益武
yingchuan han 影川韓
yingbi 影庇
yingtian fushi 燕田副使
yingtian panguan 燕田判官
yingtian xun guan 燕田巡官
yingyang zhe 影陽折
yong chang 永昌
you buchong jiedu zhuyao 右補充職度要
you chushen zhe 有出身者
youhou 幽州
yudai 魚袋
yu di 于鈇
yu xiong 余雄
yuan wai lang 员外郎
yuezhou 越州
yu zhu tu shi 禹置都史
yu zhu tong shi 禹置通史
yue shi dafu 禹史大夫
yue shi tai zhubu 禹史臺主簿
yue shi zhong sheng 禹史中承
yuan wai ding 員外典
yuzhou 越州
zhang buyi 張不疑
zhang guan 張觀
zhang huai 張懷
zhang shouji 張書記
zhang yun shen 張允伸
zhang zhao 張昭
zhang zhongli 張中立
zhao chong 趙崇
zhao jing 趙景
zhao junli 趙君李
zhao tao 招討
zhao yao 趙姚
zhao yi 趙彝
zhao zongru 趙宗儒
zhexi 浙西
zheng cong dang 鄭從讓
zheng zheng bing ma shi 鄭澄兵馬使
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>姓名</th>
<th>说明</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zheng Gao</td>
<td>zhongshu menxia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng Guang</td>
<td>zhongshu sheren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng Ji</td>
<td>zhongshu shilang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng qushi guan</td>
<td>Zhongguo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhengshui</td>
<td>Zhu Tao</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng Yu</td>
<td>zhuang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zheng Yuqing</td>
<td>zhuxiao lang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhengqiao</td>
<td>Zhuoyi jì</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhengzhai</td>
<td>Zongdang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhengzhai</td>
<td>Zongren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zhida panguan</td>
<td>zuofang jiang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zhiji hudou si</td>
<td>zuo yuhou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zhikai</td>
<td>zuo yuhou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zhishu</td>
<td>zuo yuhou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zhongshu ling</td>
<td>中書令</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Guoke congzhao 古刻叢鈔 (元·陶宗儀) in Shike shiliao xinbian vol. 10.
Jingji zhoumu yiwen 景紀周穆遺文 edited by Luo Zhen Ji—…U〈Êh Shike shiliao xinbian vol. 18.
Jinshi cuibian (JSCB) 金石萃編 (清·王昶) in Shike shiliao xinbian vol. 1-4.
Jinshi xubian (JSXB) 金石續編 (清·陸耀遹) in Shike shiliao xinbian vol. 4-5.
Tang yulin (TYL) 唐語林 (宋·王鏞). Tang yulin jiaozheng 唐語林校證 anno-
References


Hino Kaisaburo 日野開成. 1938. “Tōdai no heiteki to kinsen 唐代の開発と禁絶 (Bidi and jinqian under the Tang).” *Shien* 史運 19: 158-188.


Kikuchi Hideo 菊池英夫. 1961-62. “Setsudoshisei kakuritsu izen ni okeru kōgun' seido no koten 範度制備制確立以前における'行軍'制度の展開 (The development of the 'camp' system before the establishment of the system of military governors).” Tōyō gakuhō 44 (2): 54-88; 45 (1): 33-68.


1970. “An Shi no ran to hanchin taisei no tenkō 安史の乱と藩鎮体制の展開 (An-Shi Rebellion and the development of the provincial structure).” In Iwanami kōza seikai rekishikō 岩波講座世界史 (The Iwanami seminars on world history), volume 6, 161-196. Tōkyō: Iwanami shoten.


—— 2002a. “Tō zenshiki Kahoku chūki ni okeru hakanzoku no bunpu to An-Shi gun engen no ichi keitai (The distribution of the non-Han peoples in Hebei region in the first half of the Tang and a form of the origin of the An-Shi army).”
Todaishi kenkyū 5: 22-45.


 Zotani, Godai no zaichi yūryokusha ni tsuite 唐末五代の在地有力者について (On local power holders at the end of the Tang and in the Five Dynasties). In the Yanagida Setsuko sensei koki kinen: Chūgoku no dentō shaka to kazoku (Traditional society and family in China: Essays presented to Prof. Yanagida Setsuko on her seventieth birthday), 129-149. Edited by Yanagida Setsuko sensei koki kinen ronshu henshu iinkai. Tokyo: Kyuko shoin.


1968. “Kizoku no jidai kara shitaifu no jidai e 貴族の時代から士大夫の時代へ (From the age of aristocracy to the age of scholar-officals).” In the Chūgoku bunha sóyo 中國文化史書 (A series of Chinese culture), vol 8.


1986. Tōdai seiij shakaishi kenkyū 唐代政治社会史研究 (Studies on the political and social history of the Tang), Kyōto: Dōbōsha.


Watanabe Takashi 渡邊孝. 1988. “Tō Godai ni okeru gazen no shō ni tsuite 唐五
代における衙前の稱について（On the designation yuqian in the Tang and Five Dynasties）.” Tōyōshiron 東洋史論 6: 16-34.


1993. “Chū Tō kī ni okeru ‘monbotsu’ kizoku kanryō no dōkō: Chūō sūyōkanshoku no jinteki kōsei wo chūshin ni 中唐期における「門閥」貴族 官僚の動向：中央権要官職の人格構成を中心に（The trends of bureaucratic aristocracy in the mid-Tang period: With the focus on the composition of the essential officials in the central bureaucracy）.” In Yanagida Setsuko sensei koki kinen, 21-50.


1994b. “Gyū-Ri no tōso kenyū ni genjū to tenbō 牛李の黨爭研究の現状と展望（The state of the field and the future prospect of the study on Ni-Li factionalism）.” Shikyō 29: 69-107.


Watanabe Yoshihiro 渡邊義浩. 1995. “Sangoku jidai ni okeru ‘bungaku’ no seijiteki


