

ARTICLE

A Scottish Missionary's Reflection upon the "Failed" Mission
in Taiwan and the Detachment from the Person of Jesus, 1865-1938¹

Kazue Mino

I. INTRODUCTION: CAMPBELL N. MOODY'S REGRET

In 1932, a piece of missionary literature, titled *The King's Guests: A Strange Formosan Fellowship*, was published². It was written by Campbell N. Moody (1865-1940), a retired Scottish missionary of the Presbyterian Church of England who had engaged in nearly 30 years of missionary work, mainly in Japanese colonial Taiwan. This book is a collection of short stories depicting the people he met directly or heard of during his time there. Such individuals included Gaw Beekyen (Go Bi-kian, 1881-1922), a minister who strenuously worked for the Taiwanese Church's financial independence from the mission society³; "Mr Brown-Horse", or Lim Chhiah-be (Lim Hak-kiong, 1857-1943), a preacher who once was forced to work as a guide for the Japanese occupying troops as they advanced on the capital of Taiwan⁴; Mr Song, a preacher who, on top of the difficulty of being discriminated against by Han Taiwanese for being a Pepo, or member of the plains' tribes⁵, endured the challenging task of working in the heartland of Ma-cho worship owing to his resourcefulness⁶; and an anonymous Christian who had been a guerrilla fighter resisting the Japanese occupying army⁷. With a rich knowledge and understanding of the socio-cultural situations in Japanese colonial Taiwan, Moody honours how those Taiwanese peoples, who are largely diverse, or "strangely dissimilar" to one another⁸, accept and internalise Christianity by themselves in their respective lives and through the difficulties of racial and political divisions brought about by the historical context of Taiwan that included the Japanese colonial rule.

However, a different aspect of the Christian mission works is given in the Appendix of the same book. Pointing out the severe social divide within churches in the Western world, Moody asks "[D]oes anyone express the fear that the essence of Christianity may be misrepresented?" and "[H]ow can it fail to be misrepresented when missionaries are sent forth from a Church still so imperfectly Christian as that of Europe and America?"⁹ According to his wife and the author of

his biography, Peggie C. Moody (Margaret C. Arthur, 1891-1959), Moody at around this time was saying that his life as a missionary had “failed”¹⁰. As if to confirm this, in the Appendix of *The King's Guests*, Moody himself states, “Some of us, [...] could wish to live our missionary life all over again”¹¹. What made him conclude this book, which celebrates the lives of Taiwanese converts, with such “disturbing”¹² remarks? How exactly was the problem of the wealth gap within the church in Christian lands related to the misrepresentation of “the essence of Christianity” in his eyes?

To answer these questions, this paper will first recount Moody's early years and mission experiences in Taiwan to capture his missiological transition during 1865-1927. Based on this sketch, this paper will thereon examine Moody's biblical studies published during his later years, 1929-1938¹³.

II. BACKGROUND: EARLY YEARS AND MISSIOLOGICAL TRANSITIONS, 1865-1927

Campbell Naismith Moody was born in 1865 as the second son of a Free Church family in Bothwell, Lanarkshire. After studies at Glasgow University (1880-84) and Free Church College, Glasgow (1884-88), he joined the home mission work of Free St. John's in Glasgow, in East Hill Street, Gallowgate (1890-95) and was ordained as a minister in October 1892¹⁴. However, in 1895 he joined the mission of the Presbyterian Church of England and sailed to Taiwan¹⁵, which had been taken over by the Japanese earlier that same year as a result of the Sino-Japanese War (1894-95)¹⁶.

Being inspired by the works of the China Inland Mission¹⁷, Moody, in his own mission works, consciously attempted to maintain close contact with the people he was sent to convert through open-air evangelism, simple clothing, and a frugal lifestyle¹⁸. This face-to-face proximity with both Taiwanese converts and non-Christians played a critical role in both forming and transforming his view on the social context of Taiwan, as well as his understanding on the meaning of Christian missionary work itself. For instance, during his early years as a missionary, Moody came to critically reflect upon the shared tendency of missionaries, himself included, and colonialists to perceive ethnic and religious others using negative images such as “sadness”, “callousness”, and moral backwardness, in order to justify the foreign mission cause or colonial subjugation¹⁹. Recognising such an attitude as an unchristian “heartless self-regard”²⁰, Moody attempted to reaffirm the true significance of Christian missionary work, which is not a mere moralisation, and expressed his critical stance towards the colonial rule of both the Japanese and British Empires²¹.

On the other hand, Moody's close interactions with the Taiwanese people had also led him to the perplexing finding that not many of them, including the converts, showed genuine longing for

what he regarded as the quintessence of Christianity: That is, salvation through Jesus Christ. He noticed that heathen listeners tend to have little interest in the story of Jesus, and many of the converts were eager to talk about “the vanity of idol-worship and of the protecting power of the true God”, rather than about Jesus²². In his attempt to unravel and analyse this difficulty, Moody came to observe that Taiwanese people were fairly ready to welcome Christianity in the dimension of their “heart”, in their sincere hopes of acquiring “health and wealth and protection from demons”, and desires for the liberation from a “sense of sin”²³, while in the dimension of their “mind”, which pertains to a rational and intellectual sensibility to grasp the core teaching of Christianity, they were not sufficiently ready. However, he maintains that this difficulty was a matter of course. Pointing out that similar stumbles and attitude of selective reception of Christian ideas can be seen among the early converts in the first to third century of the Mediterranean world, he emphasises that those were due to the peculiarity and unprecedented quality of the Christian message itself²⁴. Based on such a view, he argues that every human mind has an equal potentiality to understand Christian dogma, but due to the differences in historical backgrounds, each person’s mind’s preparedness to fully understand it does differ. Thus, he posits that because of their nearly nineteen centuries of Christian intellectual inheritance, even “[t]he least saint in England or in Scotland” is far better at grasping Christian teachings than the best Christians of Taiwan, who, as he feared, cannot develop a truly Protestant church without missionaries’ guidance and leadership²⁵.

However, in the late 1920s, Moody’s missiological stance as such went through a major modification: In December 1927, he published a small article titled “The End of Foreign Missions”, in which he not only celebrated how Taiwanese churches have practically realised autonomous evangelism and church management, but also admitted that missionaries’ leadership over Taiwanese Christians was no longer a vital condition for Christianity to take root in Taiwan²⁶. The adjustment was made amid the changing situations of foreign mission movements: The optimistic confidence of the movements, symbolically expressed in the 1910 World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh, was impaired by the warfare among Christian nations in the First World War. It was also shaken by the rising anti-imperialistic, anti-Christian nationalistic movements in mission fields, especially in China after the mid 1920s. The English Presbyterian Mission itself came to struggle with financial and personnel shortages. In 1921, the Mission Council in South Taiwan formally asked Moody to request a support grant for the much deficient Taiwanese evangelists’ salaries from the Foreign Mission Committee. During the process, Moody found out how Taiwanese Christians’ strenuous efforts for self-support amid their socio-economic hardships of the post war price surge and tax increase was unappreciated by British Christians²⁷. On the other hand, exactly because of this difficulty, the church’s autonomism in Taiwan gathered steam during

the 1920s and 1930s. For instance, a scheme to divide the Presbytery of South Taiwan into the four districts of Ko-hiong (Kaohsiung), Tainan, Ka-gi (Chiayi), and Tai-tiong (Taichung), to enable more autonomous regional mission work, was introduced in 1918 and realised in 1930 at the initiative of Taiwanese church leaders, including the aforementioned minister Gaw Beekyen²⁸.

What Moody emphasises in the article, however, is his “sudden chill”, brought about by the thought that “The End of Foreign Missions” is approaching without waiting for the people of Christian lands who “had scarcely begun to give or to pray”. Contrary to the steadfast and vibrant Taiwanese churches upheld by individual Christians full of determination, people of the Christian lands were losing their interest and commitment to foreign mission work, with some of them starting to propose withdrawal from overseas fields²⁹. The article indicates how the attitude of the people of Christian lands towards others as the senders of missionaries had become Moody’s major concern rather than the matter of the preparedness of “minds” of those who receive Christianity. As will be seen below, this marks the turning point of his discussions in the late 1920s, in which he started to produce more theological pieces to ponder the issue of British or Western Christians’ incorrect approach to the biblical texts.

III. FROM INDIFFERENCE TO OTHERS TO DETACHMENT FROM JESUS, 1929-38

After their return from Taiwan to Britain in 1924 for a year’s furlough, Moody and his wife Peggie suffered a severe decline in health. Repeated attacks of fever inhibited them from returning to Taiwan, finally compelling Moody to resign from the English Presbyterian Mission in 1931³⁰. During this time, however, he continued to preach and publish several literary works including the aforementioned piece “The End of Foreign Missions”. It was also during this time that he published his very first comprehensive biblical study *The Purpose of Jesus in the First Three Gospels* (1929)³¹, based upon the Bruce Lectures series he gave at the United Free Church College, Glasgow the same year. In this book, Moody carried out a critical introspection on the theological trend of the modern Western world, which he continued in his second biblical study, *Christ for Us and in Us* (1935)³².

In *The Purpose of Jesus*, Moody solemnly raises an alert by stressing “the followers of Christ of every school are less attached to Him [Jesus] than they once were”. He points out that as a result of an arbitrary reading of the biblical texts by modern scholars to fit their “own construction of the facts” and “own conception of what is historically possible”, an interpretation that the purpose of Jesus was only to teach people some “plain moral precepts” about “God and the right attitude to Him” had gained ground among churches³³. Against this backdrop, Moody revisits the New Testament texts by particularly focusing on the accounts of Synoptic Gospels and their relationship

to Apostolic Epistles, and reaffirms that the one key message of Jesus, which was compatibly succeeded by the apostles, was actually Himself, namely “the person of Christ” and His call for “attachment to Himself” as “the sole means of entrance to God’s Kingdom”³⁴.

A closer analysis of Christology is provided in *Christ for Us and in Us*. With particular acknowledgement to the New College theologian H. R. Mackintosh’s (1870-1936) review and criticism of his manuscript, Moody emphasises that Jesus “was a Man” with “a mind of His own” as much as He “was the Son of God”, and once again critically points out how contemporary readers were “at cross-purposes” with the New Testament authors by misconstruing the central message of Jesus as pertaining to “what He taught about the Heavenly Father”³⁵. He then gives an extended analysis on the concept of atonement and reaffirms that atonement is not a balancing of “man’s [*sic*] sin” with “an equivalent sorrow and repentance”³⁶, or a “transference of suffering, or of punishment, or of guilt” as some modern scholars attempt to perceive³⁷, but rather, it is something “creative” that happens when we learn that Jesus had offered Himself as a gift “for us”, and when we have the faith to cast ourselves at His feet “in our despair” of our sinful self, and, by quitting “our self-confidence”, have “all confidence” and “boast” in Him who is “in us”³⁸.

What then, in concrete terms, were the characteristics, foundation, and outcomes of the modern Christians’ detachment from the person of Jesus, in Moody’s eyes? And how exactly was this issue related to the problem of their attitude towards others? By focusing on his two biblical studies outlined above, the author will clarify these points through the following three aspects of the issue: (1) disregard of Jesus’ words and ministry, (2) hostility against concepts of Mediation and Grace, and (3) the belittling of God and Jesus.

Disregard of Jesus’ Words and Ministry: The Characteristics

Moody believed that the contemporary Christians’ discrepancy with Jesus’ words and ministry accounted for in the Gospels was directly interwoven with their indifference and lack of commitment to the matter of social context and others living in it.

For instance, in *The Purpose of Jesus*, Moody reflects upon how “our modern minds” tend to disregard a “belief in Christ’s healing power”, which is shown in his ministry as miracles, as something of “small value” compared to “spiritual aspiration”. He then points out that a reservation of part of the biblical descriptions as such is closely intertwined with an overlook of the reality of physical and material distress, and states that “our Haven-soaring thoughts must have been far from the minds of most, if not all, of the sufferers”³⁹. His standpoint as such was based on the interpretation that the teachings of Jesus were specifically addressed to “those who had already become attached to Him”, and that Christians have the responsibility to “attain the righteousness of the Kingdom” as such people⁴⁰. Thus, Moody takes particular note of the problems of social

divisions within the contemporary Western churches, and their overall tolerance to such a situation, despite the Christological notions of Jesus' teaching of neighbourly love and His mission to serve others. For this reason, he expressed his concern that "[a] strange satanic lethargy has fallen upon us"⁴¹. Importantly, as we saw at the beginning of this paper, Moody once again shows the same concern in the Appendix of *The King's Guests* in his critical reflection upon missionaries' failure to represent "the essence of Christianity"⁴²:

From childhood they [Christians of Europe and America] have been accustomed to witness the unbrotherly exaggeration of social rank. Their Christian sense has been continually blunted by the sight of saints ill-fed, ill-clad, and narrowly housed, while their brothers and sisters have enough and to spare. How, then, can they teach others to love their neighbours as themselves, or exhibit in their own lives the pattern of Christ? Even without being aware of it, they must often carry with them the lordly, luxury-loving, and selfish ways of the society from which they spring.

Thus, by basing his ideas upon his Christocentric interpretation of the bible texts, Moody came to emphasise the relationship between Christians' attitudes towards the person of Jesus and the issues of social injustices.

Hostility against Concepts of Mediation and Grace: The Foundation

From his studies on the Synoptic Gospels and Apostolic Epistles, Moody emphasises that Christians' attitudes towards the person of Jesus also represents a soteriological significance for them, and argues that the "chief purpose" of Jesus "is to draw men [*sic*] to Himself as the sole means of entrance to God's Kingdom"⁴³. At the same time, he points out how this "notion of Christ's intercession", or Mediation, has been "fraught with difficulty" throughout history because of the human inclination towards self-justification⁴⁴, which, he argues, is a "sin" universally shared by people of every faith that is essentially hostile to "the grace of God in Christ"⁴⁵. In *Christ for Us and in Us*, Moody gives a detailed analysis of how this human desire to stand by themselves works, and observes that its driving force is the "legalism" in "our own hearts"⁴⁶. He argues that this legal tendency often pulls Christian thinkers into the wrong idea that God forgives or justifies "because He sees the better impulses which He discerns in the very worst of men [*sic*], or because He knows what excellence they may yet attain". In other words, it is a view that contends that God would justify those who deserve to be justified. Moody warns that this is a serious misconception that turns "grace into justice", and removes "transforming power" from the concept of Justification⁴⁷.

Notably, he also recognises this human tendency of self-complacency as the cause of deep

estrangement among people, and points out “how one and another of the statesmen of Europe have been labouring to disclaim responsibility” for the previous War, how “each nation is ever seeking to applaud itself, and condemn others”, and how this thus fosters “the very spirit that breeds war” because of this inclination⁴⁸.

Thus, Moody recognises that the foundation of the contemporary Christians’ detachment from the person of Jesus is essentially their “inborn” hostility against notions of Grace and Mediation, which are starkly incompatible with their desire to stand by themselves. It is also noteworthy how Moody consistently perceived the correlation between this human hostility against God and their alienation against one another.

The Belittling of God and Jesus: The Outcomes

As seen above, Moody observed that the contemporary Christians’ detachment from the person of Jesus was brought about by the universal human tendency of self-containment, which runs counter to the idea of dependency on Mediation and Grace. He noticed that the problem was also caused by the contemporary Christians’ favour of their own “modern” conceptions of the values of physical and spiritual matters, and of “disturbing” accounts in the biblical texts. The outcomes of such an attitude were the self-justifying moralism and the belittling of God and Jesus into comprehensible and favourable images in their “modern” eyes.

Moody regarded that this problem can manifestly be seen in the growing popularity of the idea that God “is love and nothing but love”. He maintains that such a view is a serious separation from Christianity, which attempts to limit God’s nature into less than that of humans⁴⁹. Importantly, as Moody continued this discussion in the Appendix of his last publication, *The Childhood of the Church*, he once again calls the readers’ attention to the connection between Christians’ indifference towards the sufferings of others, and their attitude to “banish from their minds all belief in judgement”, treat the “belief in hell” as “a delusion of the Middle Ages”, and ignore “the plain fact that the Lord Jesus had taught it” in order to secure a “hope of *ultimate* salvation”. He continues as follows⁵⁰:

To this we have come. In these days we hear of the Gospel as the one hope of a distracted world, or the one hope of a selfish and corrupt society, or even as the one means of securing the peace and happiness of the individual. But with respect to men’s [*sic*] eternal destiny, it seems no great matter how they pass the time of their sojourn here; they are safe in the hand of the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ – this same Jesus who said of one of His chosen, “Good were it for that man if he had never been born.” Had Jesus loved men [*sic*] less, He would not have uttered those solemn declarations of which the Gospels are full. In

utter faithfulness to the people whom He came to save, He kept warning them of Judgement to come.

As can readily be seen, Moody views that casting aside of God's nature as a Judge is none other than a neglect of Jesus' urgent and sincere warning. It is a withdrawal into self-containment, and thus, a rebuff to be searched, and a denial to have commitment to others in their sufferings by responding to Jesus' call for the right way to "pass the time" of our sojourn in this world. His standpoint as such becomes clearer when we see the concluding remark, or a prayer, given immediately after the quote above: He prays "Oh, that His Spirit may be imparted to us, that, loving our neighbours with His love, and faithful as He was faithful, we may be concerned for their welfare as He was concerned, and 'knowing the terror of the Lord', may persuade men [*sic*]"⁵¹.

The urgency felt by Moody on this problem cannot be fully understood without taking into account the historical context he was facing at the time. Moody's wife Peggie recollects that in his later years, especially during the 1930s, he was "dwelling often upon the problem of pain, and the meaning that suffering might have for Christians". According to her, the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War in 1937, the rising totalitarianism and pressure to mission school pupils to observe shrine attendance in Japanese colonial Taiwan⁵², as well as the plight of Jewish people in Europe, all contributed to this theological struggle⁵³. This becomes clearer when we recall how he attempted to document in his missionary literature *The King's Guests* the lives of individual Taiwanese Christians in their respective difficulties such as conventional racial division and political subjugation by an alien government. His concern over the sufferings of the Taiwanese people was most acutely highlighted in his last missionary piece of literature, *The Mountain Hut: A Tale of Formosa* (c.1937)⁵⁴, in which he describes the calamity of Taiwanese society at the dawn of Japanese colonial rule, by telling the story of "Mr Choy Tee-Ko", a Taiwanese resistance fighter modelled upon the aforementioned anonymous Christian and former guerrilla fighter he had depicted in *The King's Guests*. For Moody in his later years, a respond to the theological question of how the contemporary Christians understand, relate themselves, and answer the call of Jesus, was urgently demanded by the inseparable problem of how they should relate themselves to the world, including those whom they once encountered or had concern for as the senders of missionaries.

IV. CONCLUSION

As seen, this paper has pointed out how the theological discussions by Moody in his later years are heavily tinged with his social concern inspired by the Scottish or British society in which he

lived, and also by Japanese colonial Taiwan as his previous mission field. Based upon his Christocentric biblical interpretation, he understood that the modern Christians were losing hold of “the essence of Christianity” as they detached themselves more and more from the person of Jesus, and in tandem with this, came to have less interest and commitment to others, including their fellow Christians both in foreign and domestic lands.

On the other hand, this paper left several tasks that should be addressed in future studies. One of them is the question of where Moody's discussions should be situated on the concurrent map of the Scottish or English-speaking world's theological community. In order to clarify both the representativeness and uniqueness of Moody's discussion at the time, examinations on reviews on Moody's publications and a comparative study of Moody's discussions and that of the contemporary Scottish and English-speaking theologians and missionaries should be carried out.

NOTES

¹ This paper is partly based on the research findings made during the author's tenure as an Oversea Research Fellow of the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science (June, 2017 to June, 2019). It was first presented at the Autumn Conference of the Scottish Church History Society which was held on 2 November, 2019 at Edinburgh Theological Seminary. The conference title was "Scottish Christianity and the World." Several minor revisions have since been made to the paper.

² Moody, Campbell N. *The King's Guests: A Strange Formosan Fellowship*. London: H. R. Allenson, 1932.

³ “A Servant of Jesus Christ”. *Ibid.*, pp. 105-110.

⁴ “The Persecuted Scholar”. *Ibid.*, pp. 88-96.

⁵ “Pepo” is an inclusive term describing the native tribes in Taiwan, mostly inhabiting plain areas and known for their traditionally active cultural interactions with Han Taiwanese. On the other hand, today, the native tribes mostly dwelling in the mountain areas call themselves “*Yuanzhumin* [aborigines]” in Mandarin Chinese, implicating a positive meaning of “the people who originally have been living on this soil”.

⁶ “A Preacher's Diplomacy”. *Op. cit.*, Moody, *The Kings' Guests*, pp. 97-104. Ma-cho is a sea-goddess popularly worshipped among the Hokkien Taiwanese people.

⁷ “The Outlaw”. *Ibid.*, pp. 56-61.

⁸ “Preface”. *Ibid.*, p. vii.

⁹ “Appendix: The Impress of Christ's Love”. *Ibid.*, p. 143.

¹⁰ Moody, Peggie C. *Campbell Moody: Missionary and Scholar*, as 洪伯祺《聚珍堂史料4 宣教學者梅監務》(教會公報出版社、2005年) [Peggie C. Moody. *The Book Room Series 4 Campbell Moody: Missionary and Scholar*. Tainan: Taiwan Church News, 2005, in English and Mandarin Chinese], p. 385.

¹¹ *Op. cit.*, “Appendix: The Impress of Christ's Love”, Moody, *The King's Guests*, p. 144.

¹² “Preface”. *Ibid.*, p. vii.

¹³ 1929 was the year Moody and his wife Peggie have decided to move to their retreat in Lennoxton, and which can therefore be inferred to be the time he started to consider his retirement from foreign mission work. *Op. cit.*, Moody, Peggie C. *Missionary and Scholar*; pp. 354-355. On the other hand, 1938 was the year Moody published his last work, *The Childhood of the Church*. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1938.

¹⁴ “Minute of the Kirk Session of free St. John's on 31st October 1892”. Session Minutes 1878-95, Glasgow, St. John's Free Church, U. F. (CH3/1162/3). Glasgow City Archives, the Mitchell Library, p. 407.

¹⁵ Since its initiation in 1865 in southern Taiwan, the English Presbyterian Mission had been undertaking

medical and evangelical works for Minnan speaking Pepo and Han Taiwanese. The missionaries formed the Mission Council in 1877 in Taiwanfu (present-day Tainan), and started to organise a publishing facility and educational institutions there, which led to the inauguration of the monthly church periodical in Romanised Minnan Taiwanese, *Tâi-oân-Hú-siâⁿ Kàu-hōe-pò* (*The Taiwan Capital Church News*, hereafter *The Church News*), in 1885, and the establishment of the Theological College (1877), the Middle School (1885), and the Girls' School (1887). The Presbytery of South Taiwan, composed of Taiwanese office bearers and missionaries, was established in 1896. While street preaching and station visitations had played crucial roles in the pioneering period of the Mission, by the time of Moody's arrival, English Presbyterian missionaries in Taiwan had shifted their priority to the maintenance of existing churches and institutions. For the history of the English Presbyterian Mission in Taiwan and other fields, see Band, Edward. *Working His Purpose Out: The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947*. London: Presbyterian Church of England, 1948.

¹⁶ Op. cit., Moody, Peggie C., *Campbell Moody*, pp. 81-83, pp. 96-132.

¹⁷ Moody, Campbell N. Letter to Jeanie Renfrew. 4 May, 1898, MS, archived in the Museum of Church History, Tainan Chang Jung Senior High School, Tainan (hereafter MCH Tainan).

¹⁸ Lâm Hák-kiong. "Kò Mûi Kam-bū Bòk-su ê Sió-toân [Obituary of the Late Rev. Campbell Moody, in Romanized Minnan Taiwanese or *Pêh-ōe-jī* (hereafter POJ)]". *Tâi-oân Kàu-hōe Kong-pò* [*The Taiwan Church News*, in POJ]. 664 (July 1940): 9-12. in 《台灣教會公報全覽：台灣第一份報紙 第14卷（1939—1940）》（教會公報出版社，2004年）[*A Complete Collection of The Taiwan Church News: The First Newspaper in Taiwan*. Vol. 14 (1939-1940). Tainan: Taiwan Church News, 2004, in POJ and Mandarin Chinese].

¹⁹ Moody, Campbell N. Letter to the Mothers of Hill Street. 20 June 1898, MS.; Letter to Matthew Laurie. 4 January, 1899, MS, MCH Tainan. Op. cit., Moody, Peggie C. *Missionary and Scholar*, p. 166.

²⁰ Moody, Campbell N. *The Heathen Heart: An Account of the Reception of the Gospel Among the Chinese of Formosa*. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1907, pp. 59-64, p. 76, pp. 84-85.

²¹ *Ibid.*, p. 51.

²² *Ibid.*, pp. 212-216.

²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 117-123, p. 140.

²⁴ Moody carried out a comprehensive study on the intellectual history of the early church, by meticulously analyzing how the early converts selectively accepted Christian ideas by disregarding the weakness of Jesus on the Cross while emphasizing the absolute goodness and transcendency of the one true God. He published the work as *The Mind of the Early Converts*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1920, the scholarly contribution of which became the major reason for Glasgow University's conferment of a doctor honoris causa of Divinity on him in 1928.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 92, pp. 127-136, pp. 141-145, pp. 243-246.

²⁶ Moody, Campbell N. "The End of Foreign Missions". *The Presbyterian Messenger*: 993 (December 1927): 209-210.

²⁷ Moody, Campbell N. Letter to P. J. Maclagan. 25 March, 1921, MS.; Moody, Campbell N. Letter to P. J. Maclagan. 11 March, 1925, MS.; Maclagan, P. J. Letter to Campbell Moody. 6 March, 1925, MS, PCE/FMC Series V, Box 9, SOAS Library.

²⁸ 1918年3月12日、南部大會第四十回會議錄、第六十二條、台南長老大會 [12 March, 1918. Minute of the 40th Meeting of the Presbytery of the South Taiwan, 62nd Clause, Presbytery of South Taiwan, in Han characters] 《聚珍堂史料3 南部大會議事錄（二）1914-1927》（教會公報出版社，2004年）[*The Book Room Series 3 Minutes of the Presbytery of South Taiwan*. Vol. 2 (1914-1927). Tainan: Taiwan Church News, 2004, in Han characters and Mandarin Chinese], p. 113. At the same time, from the late 1920s onwards, several Christian periodicals in Han characters, Japanese, POJ, and a mixture of the three, were inaugurated by Taiwanese Christians, students, and the teaching staffs of the theological college. In 1932, the administration of *The Church News* as well was handed over by the Tainan Mission Council to the Taiwanese Church. Record of the Finance and General Committee (Foreign Missions) at London and within the Church Offices. 17 March, 1932. in "Finance & General Committee minutes". *Presbyterian Church of England Foreign Missions Archives, 1847-1950*. Microfiche No. 1,644.

²⁹ Op. cit., Moody, "The End of Foreign Missions", p. 210.

³⁰ Record of the Finance and General Committee (Foreign Missions), at London and within the Church Offices. 21 May. 1931. In "Finance & General Committee minutes." *Presbyterian Church of England Foreign Mission Archives, 1847-1950*. Microfiche No. 1,644.

³¹ Moody, Campbell N. *The Purpose of Jesus in the First Three Gospels*. London: Allen & Unwin,

1929.

³² Moody, Campbell N. *Christ for Us and in Us*. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1935.

³³ Op. cit., Moody, *The Purpose of Jesus*, pp. 11-16. For instance, Moody points out how the New Testament scholar E. F. Scott (1868-1954) "tends to regard Jesus as a Visionary" who "came to reveal the Father". Ibid., p. 20.

³⁴ Ibid., p. 73.

³⁵ Op. cit., Moody, *Christ for Us and in Us*, pp. 11-19.

³⁶ Ibid., pp. 33-36.

³⁷ Ibid., p. 90.

³⁸ Ibid., pp. 41-42, pp. 63-70.

³⁹ Op. cit., Moody, *The Purpose of Jesus*, pp. 61-62.

⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 66, p. 76.

⁴¹ Ibid., pp. 79-80.

⁴² Op. cit., Moody, *The King's Guests*, p. 143.

⁴³ Op. cit., Moody, *The Purpose of Jesus*, p. 73.

⁴⁴ Ibid., pp. 74-75.

⁴⁵ Op. cit., Moody, *Christ for Us and in Us*, pp. 73-75.

⁴⁶ Ibid., p. 77.

⁴⁷ Ibid., p. 81.

⁴⁸ Ibid., pp. 73-74.

⁴⁹ Op. cit., Moody, *The Purpose of Jesus*, p. 111.

⁵⁰ "Appendix: Contemporary Attitude to Jesus". Op. cit., Moody, *The Childhood of the Church*, pp. 141-143.

⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵² In 1934, the Tainan Presbyterian Middle School, the aforementioned mission school established by the English Presbyterian Mission in 1885, found itself under a severe media attack after the school board's decision to request the resignation of Japanese head teacher Uemura Kazuhito, who had largely lost the confidence of the other school staff members and stakeholders. The fierce surge of anger expressed through the media, which included reproving comments against the school from the Tainan magistrate Imagawa Fukashi (1886-??), represented the school as "unpatriotic and anti-Japanese", and suggested that Uemura had been asked to resign because he advocated shrine attendance by the school's pupils. Ultimately, the school was compelled to undergo drastic changes, including the resignation of principal Edward Band (1886-1971), school chaplain Ng Su-beng (1890-1950), and head of the board Lim Bo-seng (1887-1947).

⁵³ Op. cit., Moody, Peggie C., *Missionary and Scholar*, pp. 382-384. After his retirement from the mission of the Presbyterian Church of England in 1931, Moody continued to take close interest in the situation of Taiwan, and was learning it not only from periodicals and personal correspondences, but also from Taiwanese Christians themselves who visited him in his retreat. According to Peggie, Lim Bo-seng (see also endnote 52), a prominent Taiwanese intellectual and the son of Moody's Minnan Taiwanese tutor and colleague Lim Ian-sin (1859-1944), Lau Chu-an (1905-94), a teacher at the Tainan Presbyterian Girls' School from a distinguished Christian family in Tainan, and Ng Chiong-hui (1914-88), the son of Ng Su-beng (see also endnote 52) and a theological student in Westminster College, Cambridge, who later became a well-known theological educator and the advocate of contextualising theology, visited the missionary couple in Lennoxton between the late 1920s and 1930s. Ibid., p. 378. Lau Chu-an himself recalls his own visit to Moody's in 1937, and mentions how he learned about Lim Bo-seng's visit to them in 1928 or 1929. Lâu Chú-an. "Siàu-liām Mûi Bók-su [Missing Rev. Moody, in POJ]". *Tâi-oân Kàu-hōe Kong-pò* [*The Taiwan Church News*, in POJ]. 627 (June 1937): 8-10. in 《台灣教會公報全覽：台灣第一份報紙 第 13 卷 (1937-1938)》(教會公報出版社、2004 年) [*A Complete Collection of The Taiwan Church News: The First Newspaper in Taiwan*. Vol. 13 (1937-1938). Tainan: Taiwan Church News, 2004, in POJ and Mandarin Chinese].

⁵⁴ Moody, Campbell N. *The Mountain Hut: A Tale of Formosa*. London: The Religious Tract Society, c.1937. It should be noted that while the publication year of the book is regarded as 1938 in The Book Room Series, or a corpus of historical resources pertaining to the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (鄭仰恩 〈導讀：梅監務的白話字著作〉，《聚珍堂史料5 梅監務作品集》(教會公報出版社、2006年) [Yang-en Cheng. *The Book Room Series 5 Works by Campbell Moody*. Tainan: Taiwan Church News, 2006, in POJ and Mandarin Chinese], pp. 15-97, p. 97.), the author was also informed (on 7 September 2012) that a copy of the book with a handwritten message indicating that it was gifted to a Sunday School student in 1937 was

found. Therefore, it is likely that the book was actually published in or earlier than 1937. The author would like to express her gratitude to Ms Lo Chhen-hui 盧千恵女史 for this critical information.

(みの・かずえ 京都大学大学院教育学研究科助教)