Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Glassy Phase Separation and Crystallization of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

Tadashi Kokubo, Keizo YAMASHITA and Megumi TASHIRO*

Received October 24, 1972

The crystallization processes of the PbO 40, TiO₂ 25, SiO₂ 35 mole % glass and PbO 40, TiO₂ 25, Al₂O₃ 10, SiO₂ 25 mole % glass were investigated in detail by DTA, electrical resistivity measurement, X-ray diffraction analysis, electron microscopic observation, infrared spectroscopic analysis and fluorescent X-ray spectroscopic analysis. It was found that the former crystallizes directly forming a metastable pyrochlore-type lead titanate, whereas the latter forms the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals via a glassy two-phase separation. It is concluded that addition of the Al₂O₃ to a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glass induces a glassy two-phase separation, and as the result promotes precipitation of the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystal, thus suppressing formation of the metastable crystal.

I. INTRODUCTION

Some glasses in the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system convert into polycrystalline aggregates consisting mainly of perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals with high dielectric constants on their heating^{1~7)}. A composition region in the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system from which the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals precipitate as an initial phase is narrow, but can be expanded to some extent by addition of Al₂O₃; the Al₂O₃ enhances the precipitation of the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals probably by suppressing formation of metastable pyrochlore-type lead titanates which usually tend to precipitate in the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ compositions.⁶

In the present study, in order to provide a more sound experimental basis for reasoning the effect of the Al₂O₃ addition in enhancing the precipitation of the perovskite-type PbTiO₃, the effects of the Al₂O₃ addition on the crystallization process of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glass has been investigated in detail. Previous works dealing with crystallization process of the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glasses are few and fragmental in content especially as to effects of addition of the Al₂O₃; Martin⁴) found formation of the pyrochlore-type lead titanate crystals in PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂-(B₂O₃ or Na₂O) glasses on their heating. Russell *et al*^{2,3}) found development of a two-liquid phase separation in the PbO 34.7, TiO₂ 17.3, Al₂O₃ 10.9, SiO₂ 37.1 (by mole %) glass on its heating prior to precipitation of the perovskite– type PbTiO₃ crystals. In both reports, however, no explanation was made of the effects of addition of the Al₂O₃.

II. EXPERIMENTAL

1. Glass Preparation

Two glasses of the compositions, PbO 40, TiO₂ 25, SiO₂ 35 (glass 1) and PbO 40,

^{*} 小久保 正,山下恵造,田代 仁: Laboratory of Ceramic Chemistry, Institute for Chemical Research, Kyoto University, Uji, Kyoto.

Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Phase Separation of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

TiO₂ 25, Al₂O₃ 10, SiO₂ 25 (glass 2) by mole % were prepared. The batch materials used were red lead, titanium oxide and aluminum hydroxide, all of reagend grade, and acid-washed pure quartz powders for manufacturing optical glasses. The batches of approximately 100 g in quantity were put in a Pt10Rh crucible covered with a lid and melted in a SiC furnace at 1250°C for 30 min. The melts were poured on a steel plate, crushed to -100 mesh and remelted at 1250°C for 30 min. The melts were then cast in a graphite mold into a form of disc 3 cm in diameter and 3 mm thick. The casts were heated to 500°C in an electric furnace, and then, after the electric current was cut off, they were allowed to cool in the furnace.

2. Dynamic Analysis of Crystallization Process

2.1 Differential Thermal Analysis

The annealed glass discs were partly cut into cylindrical pieces, 9 mm in diameter and 12 mm in length, so that they fit to a hole of the sample holder of the DTA apparatus (Type DT-10B, Shimazu Seisakusho Ltd.). The DTA were made at a heating rate of $2^{\circ}C/min$. Alpha-Al₂O₃ powder was used as a reference.

The thermograms obtained for each glasses are shown in Fig. 1. Glass 1 shows an endotherm at 530° C and an exotherm at 630° C, whereas glass 2 shows an endotherm at 570° C and two exotherms at 620° and 640° C.

2.2 Electrical Resistivity Measurement during Heat-Treatment

The annealed glass discs were ground flat and finished with 2000 grade alumina powders. Their final thickness was about 2 mm. After gold electrodes were vacuum– evaporated on the discs with a guard ring annulus on one side, they were placed in a nickel– chrome steel (NAS-20) sample holder, and heated at a rate of 1.3°C/min in a nichrome– wounded furnace, as schematically shown in Fig. 2. During the heating, the resistivities were measured under an alternative field at a frequency of 30 c/sec for preventing electrode



(609)





Fig. 2. Sample cell for measurement of electrical properties.

polarization, using a transformers bridge (Type TRS-B, Ando Electric Co. Ltd.).

The results are shown in Fig. 3. Glass 1 exhibits an inflection at approximately 540°C and a minimum at 620°C in its resistivity versus temperature curve, whereas glass 2 exhibits an inflection at 560°C and two minima at 610° and 620°C. These inflections and minima corresponded nearly to the temperatures of the endotherm and exotherms for each glass, although their exact correlation was difficult because of the difference in the heating rate between the resistivity measurement and DTA.



Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Phase Separation of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

Fig. 3. Log10 (resistivity) at 30 c/s vs. reciprocal absolute temperature.

3. Static Analysis of Crytallization Process

The foregoing dynamic analyses suggest structural changes at $530^{\circ}-540^{\circ}$ C and $620^{\circ}-630^{\circ}$ C in glass 1, and at $560^{\circ}-570^{\circ}$ C, $610^{\circ}-620^{\circ}$ C and $620^{\circ}-640^{\circ}$ C in glass 2. In order to investigate these changes, the glasses as-annealed and heated, at a rate of 1.3° C/min, to various temperatures below and above these temperatures were subjected to the following analyses.

3.1. X-Ray Diffraction Analysis

For glass 1, no crystal was found in any of the specimens heated up to temperatures below 600°C whereas the crystals reported by Martin⁴) as a pyrochlore-type lead titanate were found in the specimen heated up to 630°C. This titanate was found to be transformed into the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystal near 700°C. For glass 2, no crystal was found in any of the specimens heated up to temperatures below 615°C whereas the perovskitetype PbTiO₃ crystals were found in the specimens heated up to temperatures above 625°C.

3.2 Electron Microscopic Observation

The fracture surfaces of the specimens were etched with 10% HCl and replicated with carbon film shadowed by platinum-palladium. Some of the electron micrographs of the replicas are shown in Fig. 4, from which the following structural changes can be seen: glass 1 as-annealed has a uniform structure but, when heated to 630°C, forms a large number of irregularly-shaped particles approximately 5000 Å in size. On the contrary, for glass 2 a large number of tiny particles 200 to 500 Å in diameter are observed even in the specimen as-annealed. These particles grow to a few thousand angström in diameter on heating to 615°C, and on further heating to 625°C, their forms change from

fairly round to irregular while their size remains almost unchanged.

3.3 Electrical Resistivity Measurement

The d.c. resistivities at temperatures 200° to 300°C were measured of the as-annealed and heat-treated glasses with a Teraohmmeter (Type RM-21, Yokogawa Electric Works Ltd.).

The results are shown in Fig. 5, which indicates that for both glasses 1 and 2, the d.c. resistivities at 200° to 300°C remain unchanged when the maximum temperatures of their heat treatment are below those corresponding to the minima of their a.c. resistivities, *i.e.* 620°C for glass 1 and 610°C for glass 2, whereas once they are heat-treated over those temperatures the d.c. resistivities increase. Activation energies for d.c. conduction obtained from the data shown in Fig. 5 were almost constant irrespective of the temperature of the preceding heat treatment for each glass; 27 Kcal/mole for glass 1 and 30 Kcal/mole for glass 2.

3.4 Infrared Spectroscopic Analysis

The infrared absorptions of the glasses 1 and 2 were measured with a double-beam





- (b) Glass 1 heated to 630° C.
- (c) Glass 2 as-annealed
- (d) Glass 2 heated to 615° C.
- (e) Glass 2 heated to 625° C.





Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Phase Separation of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

Fig. 5. Effect of heat-treatment on d. c. resistivity

automatic infrared spectrometer (Perkin-Elmer 521) by a KBr disc method. As references, those of two glasses of the compositions PbO 50, SiO_2 50, and PbO 47.5, TiO_2 47.5, SiO_2 5 by mole %, of which the latter was prepared by "splat quenching" method⁸), as well as three crystalline powders of PbO, Pb₃O₄ and perovskite-type tetragonal PbTiO₃ were used.

The results are shown in Fig. 6. In the spectrum of as-annealed glass 1, broard bands are observed near 925, 730, 600 and 470 cm⁻¹. On heating to 630° C, a sharp peak at 1045 cm⁻¹ newly appears and the intensity of the absorption near 800–600 cm⁻¹ decreases whereas that near 600–400 cm⁻¹ increases.

In the spectrum of as-annealed glass 2, broad bands are observed near 950, 630 and 470 cm⁻¹. On heating to 615° C and then to 625° C, the band near 950 cm⁻¹ shifts to higher frequencies, and at 625° C the absorptions near 570 and 350 cm⁻¹ increase their intensities.

3.5 Fluorescent X-Ray Spectroscopic Analysis

In order to determine the coordination number of the Al atom to the oxygen atoms, as-annealed and heat-treated glasses 2 were subjected to the fluorescent X-ray spectroscopic analyses, using α -Al₂O₃ powder as a standard material containing six-fold coordinated aluminum, and K-feldspar and Na-feldspar as those containing four-fold coordinated aluminum. The fluorescent X-ray spectra were registered with a automatic fluorescent



Fig. 6. Infrared spectra of crystals and glasses

X-ray spectrometer (Geigerflex KG-4, Rigaku Denki Kogyo Co., Ltd.) on the following conditions;

X-ray tube: Cr target, Applied field: 50 KV Tube current: 40 mA, Detector: Gas flow proportional counter



Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Phase Separation of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

Fig. 7. Graphical representation of $\Delta 2\Theta$, difference in diffraction angle of Al-Ka radiation between Al metal and Al ion in various minerals and glass 2.

Pulse height analyzer: Differential, Monochromator crystal: EDDT (2d=8.808 Å) Dispersion angle of solar slit: 0.15° X-ray path: Vacuum ($10^{-1}-10^{-2}$ mmHg) Temperature: $29.0 \pm 1.0^{\circ}$ C

Positions of Al-Ka peaks measured at 90%-maximum intensity are shown of the glasses and the standard materials in Fig. 7. They were represented in terms of displacement from that of the aluminum metal measured together. The positions of Al-Ka peaks for glasses 2 almost agree, irrespective of heat treatment, with those of K- and Na-feldspars both containing four-fold coordinated Al atoms.

III. DISCUSSION

1. Crytallization Process of Glass 1

The electron micrograph indicates that as-annealed glass 1 is homogeneous. The endotherm and the inflection in the a.c. resistivity found at $530^{\circ}-540^{\circ}$ C is considered to be indications of glass transformation, because no change in structure was detected by any of the static analyses made for the specimens once heated to or a little over this temperature. As confirmed by X-ray diffraction analysis, precipitation of the pyrochlore-type lead titanate crystals from this glass occurs at $620^{\circ}-630^{\circ}$ C, being accompanied by the

exotherm and the increase in the a.c. resistivity. The fact that no change in the structure was detected by any of the static analyses made for the specimens once heated to a little below this crystallization temperature further leads to a conclusion that the crystals precipitate directly from the homogeneous glass, without precursory structural change in the mother glass such as glassy two-phase separation.

A deeper insight into change in the internal structure of the glass on heating can be gained from its infrared absorption studies: First, consider coordinations of Si⁴⁺, Ti⁴⁺ and Pb²⁺ ions in as-annealed glass 1. For a large number of silicate glasses, the absorption band characteristic of Si-O stretching vibrations is observed at a frequency of 900- $1100 \text{ cm}^{-1.9}$ The band near 925 cm⁻¹ found in the spectrum of as-annealed glass 1 is, therefore, assigned to this vibrations. This is also supported by the fact that such a band is also found in those of the SiO₂-containing oxides such as the PbO-SiO₂, PbO-TiO2-SiO2 and PbO-TiO2-Al2O3-SiO2 glasses, but not in those of the PbO, Pb3O4 and PbTiO₃ crystals. The frequency value of this band, 925 cm^{-1} , due to the Si-O stretching vibrations, however, is rather low in comparison with that of the PbO 50, SiO₂ 50 glass examined in the present work as well as those of the other silicate glasses.^{9,10} Since the frequency of the band due to the Si-O stretching vibrations generally decreases as SiO_4 tetrahedra become isolated, 9,10) the above fact indicates that the SiO₄ tetrahedra in asannealed glass 1 are fairly uniformly distributed in an isolated state. This is consistent with the result of the electron microscopic study that the glass 1 as-annealed and heated to temperatures a little below the crystallization temperature was not separated into twoglassy phases but homogeneous. The absorption bands characteristic of the Ti-O stretching vibrations in four-fold coordination and six-fold coordination are generally located at 800-690 and 650-500 cm⁻¹, respectively.⁹⁾ In fact, such bands were observed for the TiO₂-containing oxides such as the PbTiO₃ crystal, the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ and PbO-TiO₂- Al_2O_3 -SiO₂ glasses, but not for the PbO crystal, the Pb₃O₄ crystal and the PbO-SiO₂ glass. The bands near 730 and 600 cm⁻¹ in the spectrum of as-annealed glass 1 are, therefore, attributed to the Ti-O stretching vibrations in the four-fold and six-fold coordination, respectively. It is known that TiO₄ tetrahedra can replace SiO₄ tetrahedra¹¹ and Pb^{2+} ions, forming PbO_4 tetrahedra, also enter into glass networks, especially when the PbO content is high.^{12,13)} In as-annealed glass 1, therefore, SiO₄, TiO₄ and PbO₄ tetrahedra may be fairly uniformly distributed, forming a glass network, while the remaining Ti⁴⁺ and Pb²⁺ ions may sit in holes in the network as modifiers.

Infrared spectrum of glass 1 heated to 630°C affords an insight into the structure of the pyrochlore-type lead titanate precipitating in the glass. In comparison with the spectrum of as-annealed glass 1, that of glass 1 heated to 630°C has a stronger absorption band at 600–500 cm⁻¹ characteristic of TiO₆ octahedra and a new sharp peak at 1045 cm⁻¹ characteristic of SiO₄ tetrahedra in crystals respectively. This result is in good accordance with the model of the pyrochlore-type lead titanate presented by Martin⁴⁾ that the crystal is composed essentially of PbO₆ and TiO₆ octahedra and in addition a small amount of SiO₄ tetrahedra.

2. Crystallization Process of Glass 2

The electron microscopic observation shows that as-annealed glass 2 is already separated into two glassy phases; glassy droplets 200 to 500 Å in diameter and continuous

Effects of Al₂O₃ Addition on Phase Separation of a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ Glass

glassy matrix. Since the PbTiO₃ crystals appear to precipitate in the droplet phase at the final stage of the heating as described later in detail, it is probable that the droplets are enriched with PbO and TiO₂ whereas the matrix is enriched with SiO₂. The enrichment with SiO₂ is also indicated by the heigher frequency of the infrared absorption band due to the Si-O stretching vibrations for as-annealed glass 2 than that for as-annealed glass 1; *i.e.*, 950 cm⁻¹ for glass 2 whereas 925 cm⁻¹ for glass 1. The infrared spectrum also indicates that much of the titanium ions condensed in the droplets are in six-fold coordination because the absorption near 630 cm⁻¹ for as-annealed glass 2 is much stronger than that for as-annealed glass 1. It should be noted that this coordination number is the same as that of the Ti⁴⁺ ions in the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals precipitating at the later stage.

On heating, glass 2 undergoes glass-transformation at $560^{\circ}-570^{\circ}$ C as indicated by the endotherm and the inflection in the a.c. resistivity. The exotherm and the sudden increase in the a.c. resistivity at $610^{\circ}-620^{\circ}$ C is ascribed to a rapid progress of glassy twophase separation because in the glass heated to 615° C no crystal was detected by the Xray diffraction analysis but big glassy droplets were found by the electron microscopic analysis. These big droplets may be considered to have been produced by marked growth of the minute glassy droplets which pre-existed in the glass as-annealed but not by their coalescence, because the growth is accompanied by an irreversible increase in the electric resistivity. If so, the glassy two-phase separation at $610^{\circ}-620^{\circ}$ C would accelerate concentration of SiO₂ in the continuous matrix phase. In fact, the infrared spectroscopic analyses show that the Si-O stretching vibration of near 950 cm⁻¹ shifts to higher frequency on heating to 615° C.

The exotherm and the increase in the a.c. resistivity at $620^{\circ}-640^{\circ}C$ are ascribed to precipitation of the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals as indicated by the X-ray analysis. The PbTiO₃ crystals appear to precipitate in the glassy droplets because the grain size and the distribution of the as-separated PbTiO₃ crystals were similar to those of the glassy droplets.

A big difference between the crystallization process in glass 1 and 2 is that, as a precursory of the formation of the perovskite-type crystals, the precipitation of the metastable pyrochlore-type lead titanate crystals occurs in glass 1 whereas the glassy two-phase separation occurs in glass 2. Once glassy droplets enriched with PbO and TiO₂ are formed by the glassy two-phase separation, the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals would be easy to precipitate in the glassy droplets more or less analogous in composition and hence in structure to those of the crystals. This is probably the reason why the perovskitetype PbTiO₃ crystals are precipitated directly from glass 2 without going through any precipitation of metastable crystals. Why the addition of the Al_2O_3 to the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system enhances its glassy two-phase separation will be discussed in the next section.

3. Effects of Addition of Al₂O₃ on Glassy Two-Phase Separation

It is known that addition of the Al_2O_3 to alkaline or alkaline-earth silicate glasses is effective in reducing their tendency toward glassy two-phase separation.^{14,15} The addition of the Al_2O_3 to the present PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system, however, showed the reversed effect, *i.e.*, its addition rather promoted the phase separation.

The former effect has been attributed by Warren¹⁵⁾ to the ability of the Al³⁺ ion to

replace Si⁴⁺ ion isomorphously in the glass structure. Later, one of the present authors¹⁶) has presented a more detailed explanation: The phase-separation in oxide glasses arises from the competition among various cations to provide themselves with oxygen ions in accordance with their own coordination number.¹⁷) If the field strength of modifier cation in silicate glasses is higher, these cations tend to cluster to provide themselves with their original holes of the silica network. Actually, for example, the Li₂O-SiO₂ and CaO-SiO₂ systems show such a tendency. When the Al₂O₃ is added to these binary systems, the Al³⁺ ion replaces Si⁴⁺ ion isomorphously and seizes the polarizable singly bonded oxygen ion accompanied with the modifier cations to acheive its four-fold coordination, and thus the phase separation of the system is suppressed.

In order to explain the reversed effect of the Al_2O_3 on the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system, one must take into consideration the fact that in this system there are no typical modifier ions and all the oxygens are accompanied with network-forming or intermediate cations.

The published phase diagram¹⁸) of the TiO₂-SiO₂ system shows a wide stable immiscible region from 20 to 90 mole % TiO₂. This is understandable because both cations in this system have high field strengths; those of Si⁴⁺ and Ti⁴⁺ ions are 1.25 and 0.96, respectively, as expressed by $Z_i/(r_i+r_o)^2$, where Z_i is the valency of the cation, and r_i





and r_{ρ} are the ionic radii of the cation and oxygen ion, respectively. When the PbO is added to the TiO_2 -SiO₂ system, a tendency toward phase separation will be suppressed because the strong demands of the Si^{4+} and Ti^{4+} ions to be surrounded by polarizable oxygen ions are partly satisfied by the oxygen ions accompanied by the Pb²⁺ ions whose field strength is as low as 0.27. In fact, one of the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glasses, *i.e.*, glass 1, did not show any glassy two-phase separation. When the Al_2O_3 is further added to the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ system, the Al³⁺ ions will replace Si⁴⁺ ions. In fact, the presence of the Al³⁺ ions coordinated with four oxygen ions in glass 2 has been confirmed by the fluorescent X-ray analyses in the present study. However, since this system contains no alkaline ions and accordingly no singly bonded oxygen the Al³⁺ ions must utilize oxygens already bridging two tetrahedra, as shown in Fig. 8. This type of structural unit, named as "tricluster" because one oxygen is shared with three tetrahedral groups, is well known in some crystals and was first suggested to exist also in some of glasses by Lacy.¹⁹⁾ Since the Al³⁺ ions have a field strength as high as 1.77, the demand of the Al³⁺ ion to be surrounded by oxygen ions would hardly be satisfied by the oxygen ions bridging two Si⁴⁺ ions with high field strengths. Then the Al³⁺ ions tend to form own phase in which they can find in their vicinity rather polarizable oxygen ions by forming the triclusters with the Pb^{2+} or Ti^{4+} ions. This may be a reason why the Al_2O_3 introduced to the PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glass induces the glassy two-phase separation.

IV. SUMMARY

1. It is concluded that the glass of PbO 40, TiO₂ 25, SiO₂ 35 by mole %, as annealed, has a homogeneous structure being composed of a network of uniformly distributed SiO₄, TiO₄ and PbO₄ tetrahedra and modifier ions of Ti⁴⁺ and Pb²⁺ sitting in holes in the network. On heat treatment, the glass crystallizes directly forming a metastable pyrochlore– type lead titanate dissolving small amount of SiO₂, without going through any precursory structural change such as glassy two-phase separation. At an elevated temperature, the pyrochlore-type crystals transform to the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals.

The glass of PbO 40, TiO₂ 25, Al₂O₃ 10, SiO₂ 25 by mole %, as-annealed, has a two-phase structure being composed of a large number of minute glassy droplets rich in PbO and TiO₂ and a continuous glassy matrix rich in SiO₂. On heat treatment, the droplets first grow in size at the expence of the matrix, so rapidly as a sharp exotherm peak can be observed in DTA, and then the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals precipitate in the droplets.

2. It is concluded that addition of the Al_2O_3 to a PbO-TiO₂-SiO₂ glass induces a glassy two-phase separation, and as a result promotes precipitation of the perovskite-type PbTiO₃ crystals in the PbO- and TiO₂-rich phase, thus suppressing formation of the metastable crystal. The effect of the Al_2O_3 on the glassy two-phase separation is interpreted in terms of "tricluster" model proposed by Lacy and the field strengths of the constituent ions.

REFERENCES

- (1) S. D. Stookey, U. S. Pat, 2, 290, 971 (1960).
- (2) C. K. Russell, C. G. Bergeron, J. Amer. Ceram. Soc., 48, 162 (1965).
- (3) C. K. Russell, C. G. Bergeron, ibid, 48, 268 (1965).

- (4) F. W. Martin, Phys. Chem. Glasses, 6, 143 (1965).
- (5) D. G. Grossman, J. O. Isard, J. Amer. Ceram. Soc., 52, 230 (1969).
- (6) T. Kokubo, H. Nagao, M. Tashiro, J. Ceram. Assoc. Japan, 77, 293 (1969).
- (7) T. Kokubo, M. Tashiro, ibid, 78, 58 (1970).
- (8) P. T. Sarjeant, R. Roy, J. Amer. Ceram. Soc., 50, 500 (1967).
- (9) P. Tarte, Physics of Non-Crystalline Solid, p. 549, Interscience Pub, New York (1965).
- (10) V. A. Florinskaya, R. S. Pechenskina, The Structure of Glass, Vol. 1, p. 55, Consultant Bureau Inc., New York (1958).
- (11) P. Hartman, Mineral. Mag., 37, 366 (1969).
- (12) K. Furukawa, Sci. Rep. Res. Insts. Tohoku Univ., A 12, 150 (1960).
- (13) M. Leventhal, P. J. Bray, Phys. Chem. Glasses, 6, 113 (1965).
- (14) Y. Moriya, J. Ceram. Assoc. Japan, 78, 196 (1970).
- (15) B. E. Warren, A. G. Pincus, J. Amer. Ceram. Soc., 23, 301 (1940).
- (16) M. Tashiro, Proceedings 8th International Congress of Glass, p. 113, (1968).
- (17) E. M. Levin, J. Amer. Ceram. Soc., 50, 29 (1967).
- (18) Phase Diagram for Ceramists, p. 69, The American Ceramic Society, Inc., (1964).
- (19) E. D. Lacy, Phys. Chem. Glasses, 4, 234 (1963).